



Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu](#)

[The Culture, Welsh Language and
Communications Committee](#)

30/11/2016

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)
[Meeting Agenda](#)

[Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor](#)
[Committee Transcripts](#)

Cynnwys
Contents

- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 5 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth y Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 4
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:
Evidence Session 4
- 53 Papurau i'w Nodi
Papers to Note
- 53 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth y Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 5
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:
Evidence Session 5
- 74 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod ar gyfer Eitem 7
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting for Item 7

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i'w dystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Hannah Blythyn Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Dawn Bowden Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Suzy Davies Bywgraffiad Biography	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Neil Hamilton Bywgraffiad Biography	UKIP Cymru UKIP Wales
Bethan Jenkins Bywgraffiad Biography	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Dai Lloyd Bywgraffiad Biography	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Jeremy Miles Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Lee Waters Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Angela Jardine	Cyngor y Gweithlu Addysg Education Workforce Council
Gwilym Dyfri Jones	Prifysgol Cymru y Drindod Dewi Sant The University of Wales Trinity Saint David
Hayden Llewellyn	Cyngor y Gweithlu Addysg Education Workforce Council
Daniel Tiplady	Cardiff Metropolitan University Prifysgol Metropolitan Caerdydd

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Osian Bowyer	Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Steve George	Clerc Clerk
Manon Huws	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol Legal Adviser
Adam Vaughan	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:15.

The meeting began at 09:15.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest

[1] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn. Rŷm ni'n dechrau'r cyfarfod ffurfiol, a chroeso i bawb. Nid oes ymddiheuriadau neu ddirprwyon yma heddiw. Os bydd larwm tân, dylai pawb adael yr ystafell drwy'r allanfeydd tân penodol a dilyn cyfarwyddiadau tywyswyr a'r staff. Ni ddisgwylir prawf heddiw. Dylai pawb droi eu ffonau symudol i fod yn dawel.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. We start the formal meeting, and welcome to everybody. There are no apologies or substitutions here today. In the event of a fire alarm, everyone should leave the room via the fire exits and follow instructions from the ushers and staff. An alarm is not expected today. Everyone should turn their mobile phones to silent.

[2] The National Assembly does operate bilingually, and headphones are available to hear simultaneous translation and to adjust the audio for people who are hard of hearing. Simultaneous translation is available on channel 1 and sound amplification on channel 0.

[3] Peidiwch â chyffwrdd y botymau sy'n o'ch blaen chi oherwydd y gall hyn amharu ar y

Do not touch any of the buttons on the microphones because this can disable the system, and ensure that

system, a gwnewch yn siŵr bod y the red light is on before speaking.
golau coch ymlaen cyn dechrau
siarad.

[4] A oes gan unrhyw fuddiannau Has anyone got any interests to
i'w datgan yma y bore yma? Na. declare this morning? No.

09:16

Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth y Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 4
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:
Evidence Session 4

[5] **Bethan Jenkins:** Eitem 2: **Bethan Jenkins:** Item 2: inquiry into
ymchwiliad i strategaeth yr iaith the Welsh Government's draft Welsh
Gymraeg ddrafft Llywodraeth language strategy—evidence session.
Cymru—sesiwn dystiolaeth. Mae We have witnesses here today—
gennym ni dystion yma heddiw— Gwilym Dyfri Jones, associate pro
Gwilym Dyfri Jones, dirprwy is- vice-chancellor at the University of
ganghellor cysylltiol, Prifysgol Cymru Wales Trinity Saint David—welcome
y Drindod Dewi Sant—croeso i chi—a to you—and Daniel Tiplady, Welsh-
Daniel Tiplady, rheolwr darpariaeth medium provision manager at Cardiff
cyfrwng Cymraeg Prifysgol Metropolitan University—welcome to
Metropolitan Caerdydd—a chroeso i you as well.
chi hefyd.

[6] **Mr Tiplady:** Diolch yn fawr. **Mr Tiplady:** Thank you.

[7] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae yna nifer **Bethan Jenkins:** There are a number
o gwestiynau gennym ni fel Aelodau of questions that we have as
Cynulliad, ac rŷm ni'n mynd i fynd i Members, and we're going to go
gwestiynau yn syth. Ac felly, i straight to questions. And so, to start
gychwyn, roeddwn i jest eisiau with, I just wanted to ask what you
gofyn—beth ydych chi'n meddwl o'r think of the Welsh Government's
amcan llywodraethol o gael 1 filiwn o stated aim of reaching 1 million
siaradwyr erbyn 2050? Pa fath o Welsh speakers by 2050. What sort of
newidiadau yr ydych chi'n credu sydd changes do you think are needed on
eu hangen yn ymarferol er mwyn a practical level to try to realise that,
ceisio gwireddu hynny? Os oes and if you have any examples along
enghreiffitiau gyda chi ar hyd y ffordd the way of how this could happen,

o sut y gall hyn ddigwydd, yna plis rhannwch nhw gyda ni fel pwyllgor. Ond beth, yn reddfoll, yw eich barn ynglŷn â'r amcan yma yn benodol? Diolch yn fawr.

then please share them with us as a committee. So, instinctively, what are your views on this aim specifically? Thank you.

[8] **Mr Jones:** Iawn. Wel, yn y lle cyntaf, diolch yn fawr iawn i chi am y cyfle yma y bore yma. Fel sefydliad, rŷm ni'n croesawu strategaeth ddrafft y Llywodraeth yn fawr iawn. Rŷm ni'n croesawu'r ffaith bod modd cynllunio ar gyfer yr hirdymor. Mae yna nodau clir iawn yn y ddogfen. Yn hynny o beth, rŷm ni'n pryderu rhywfaint nad oes yna, ar hyn o bryd, raglen waith neu gynllun gweithredu a thargedau tymor byr, felly, fel y gellid mesur cynnydd o flwyddyn i flwyddyn neu o gyfnod i gyfnod. Rŷm ni hefyd yn llawn sylweddoli bod llawer iawn o randdeiliaid yn cefnogi'r Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd, ac mi hoffem ni weld elfen ychydig mwy gydweithredol yn cael ei phwysleisio yn y ddogfen, lle bod rôl a swyddogaethau'r holl randdeiliaid yn cael eu diffinio ychydig bach yn gliriach, a bod pawb yn ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldeb a'u cyfraniad posibl nhw at y strategaeth.

Mr Jones: Well, first of all, thank you very much for the opportunity to appear before you this morning. As an institution, we welcome the Welsh Government's draft strategy very warmly. We welcome the fact that we can plan for the long term. There are clearly set out goals in the document. We are a little concerned that, at the moment, there is no action plan and short-term targets in place, so that we can measure progress from year to year or from stage to stage. We also fully understand that many stakeholders support the Welsh language at the moment, and I would like to see a more collaborative element emphasised in the document, where the role and functions of all of those stakeholders could be more clearly defined, so that everyone should be aware of their responsibilities and of their possible contribution to the strategy.

[9] Ond yn gyffredinol, rŷm ni yn croesawu cyfeiriad y strategaeth ac rŷm ni'n sicr, fel sefydliad, yn awyddus iawn i chwarae rhan weithredol a chadarnhaol i fynd â'r maen i'r wal, felly.

But generally speaking, we welcome the direction of travel of the strategy, and as an institution, we are very eager to play an active and positive role in achieving this goal, therefore.

[10] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes gyda chi—?

Bethan Jenkins: Do you have anything?

[11] **Mr Tiplady:** Dim ond ategu beth mae Gwilym wedi'i ddweud—rŷm ni'n hapus iawn gyda'r targed, ac mae'n rhywbeth positif iawn y gallwn ni anelu tuag ato. Un cwestiwn sydd gyda ni fel sefydliad yw: beth yw'r diffiniad o siaradwr Cymraeg? Rŷm ni'n teimlo bod hynny'n rhywbeth pwysig iawn i'w ddiffinio. Rŷm ni'n ei weld e ymysg ein staff ac ymysg ein myfyrwyr ni—mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn tanwerthu eu gallu yn y Gymraeg. Ymysg ein staff ni, mae rhyw 30 y cant yn nodi bod ganddyn nhw sgiliau yn y Gymraeg; o'r rheini, dim ond 5 y cant sy'n nodi eu bod nhw'n rhugl yn y Gymraeg. Felly, mae'n darged uchelgeisiol, mae'n darged y gallem ni anelu ato, ac mae'n rhywbeth positif iawn, ond rwy'n credu bod eisiau diffinio, fel y targedau ac fel y camau y mae Gwilym wedi'u nodi, beth rŷm ni'n ystyried fel siaradwr Cymraeg.

Mr Tiplady: I just want to endorse what Gwilym has said. We're very happy with the target and it's a very positive thing that we can aim for. One question that we do have as an institution is: what is the definition of a Welsh speaker? We feel that that is something that's very important to define. We see it amongst our staff and our students—the majority of people tend to undervalue their use of Welsh. Amongst our staff, about 30 per cent note they have skills in the Welsh language, but of those, only 5 per cent note that they are fluent. So, it is quite an ambitious target. It's a target that we can aim for, and it's very positive, but I think we need to define, as the targets and the steps that Gwilym has noted, what we consider to be a Welsh speaker.

[12] **Bethan Jenkins:** A gaf i jest ofyn yn gyflym, felly: sut ydych chi fel mudiad yn ei ddiffinio fe ar hyn o bryd? Achos rŷm ni wedi clywed hynny, ond, wrth gwrs, mae'n bwysig ein bod ni'n deall ei fod e ddim yn gysyniad newydd o ran ennyn pobl i siarad Cymraeg. Sut fydddech chi'n diffinio hynny, yn eich barn chi, yn barod, fel ein bod ni yn cael rhyw fath o ddealltwriaeth, ai dim ond dweud 'bore da', 'shwmâi', 'hwyl fawr', neu ai cynnal rhyw fath o ddadl yn y Gymraeg?

Bethan Jenkins: Could I just ask quickly, therefore: how, as an organisation, do you define it at the moment? Because we have heard that, but, of course, it's important that we understand that it's not a new concept in terms of attracting people to speak Welsh. How would you define that, in your view, so that we have some understanding? Is it just saying 'good morning', 'hello' 'goodbye', or is it holding some sort of discussion or debate in the Welsh language?

[13] **Mr Tiplady:** Roeddwn i'n

Mr Tiplady: Well, I anticipated that

meddwl y byddech chi'n gofyn y cwestiwn yna i fi, ac mae'n flin gyda fi, ond nid oes ateb da neu ateb perffaith gyda fi, ta beth. Mae gwahanol bobl yn rhoi eu hunain ar wahanol lefelau. Beth rŷm ni wedi bod yn ei wneud yw edrych ar: peth sgiliau yn y Gymraeg, rhai sgiliau yn y Gymraeg a rhugl yn y Gymraeg. Rŷm ni nawr, wrth baratoi tuag at y safonau iaith nawr, yn symud tuag at bump lefel o ddatganiadau positif ynglŷn â gallu yn y Gymraeg—y *can-do statements*—ynglŷn â ble rŷm ni yn y Gymraeg. Rŷm ni wedi ffeindio ein bod ni'n symud oddi wrth y syniad hwn o'r Gymraeg yn hanfodol, neu fod yn rhugl yn y Gymraeg, achos beth sy'n digwydd yw, wrth drial denu myfyrwyr ac aelodau o staff sy'n gallu gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, rŷch chi'n rhoi ofn i lot o bobl, felly mae trial ei ddiffinio fe yn rhywbeth anodd, a beth rŷm ni wedi'i wneud yw, yn hytrach na thrial diffinio beth yw siaradwr Cymraeg, ar gyfer ein gweithlu ni, rŷm ni wedi edrych ar ba sgiliau yn y Gymraeg sy'n angenrheidiol, ac weithiau, sgiliau lefel isel ac weithiau sgiliau lefel uchel. Felly, mae'n flin gen i, nid yw hynny'n ateb eich cwestiwn chi, achos mae'n rhywbeth nad ŷm ni wedi gallu cael ateb iddo fe hyd yn hyn ychwaith.

question, and I'm sorry I don't have a perfect answer to it, because various people place themselves on different stages of the continuum. What we have been doing is looking at some skills in the Welsh language, towards fluency in the Welsh language. We now have, in preparing towards the language standards, five levels of positive statements—they're can-do statements on the Welsh language—in terms of where people are. We have found that we're moving away from this concept of fluency in the Welsh language, because what happens in trying to attract students or staff members who can work through the medium of Welsh is that you actually scare them away. Therefore, trying to define it can be difficult. What we have done is, rather than trying to define what a Welsh speaker is for our workforce, we have looked at what skills are necessary in the Welsh language and, on occasion, they are low-level skills and on other occasions they are high-level skills. I'm sorry, that doesn't answer your question, because it is something that we haven't yet found an answer to ourselves.

[14] **Bethan Jenkins:** Gwilym. Rwy'n marcio hwn, gyda llaw—na. [*Chwerthin.*]

Bethan Jenkins: Gwilym. I'm marking this, by the way—no. [*Laughter.*]

[15] **Mr Jones:** Mae'n rhaid bod yna elfen o allu cyfathrebu a chyflwyno gwasanaeth yn Gymraeg, oherwydd yn y pen draw, beth rŷm ni am ei weld drwy'r strategaeth yw bod mwy o Gymry Cymraeg yn defnyddio'r iaith, ac felly mae'r hyder hynny yn mynd i gynyddu os oes yna staff sy'n delio â'r cyhoedd sy'n gallu gwneud hynny yn yr iaith. Felly, mae'n rhaid bod yna elfen o ruglder i allu cyfathrebu a chynnal sgwrs gychwynnol yn y Gymraeg, dybiwn i.

Mr Jones: There needs to be an element of communication and offering a service through the medium of Welsh, because ultimately, what we want to see through this strategy is that more Welsh speakers use the language and therefore that confidence is going to increase if there are staff dealing with the public and able to do so through the medium of Welsh. So, there needs to be an element of fluency to be able to communicate and hold an initial conversation, I would say.

[16] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. Rŷm ni'n symud ymlaen at gadw a recriwtio athrawon, ac mae Dai yn mynd i arwain ar yr adran yma, gyda Dawn yn dod mewn ar ei ôl.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. We're going to move on to the retention and recruitment of teachers, and Dai is going to lead on this, with Dawn following up.

[17] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd. Diolch am eich atebion cychwynnol yn fanna. Yn benodol, felly, yn eich rôl fel prifysgolion sydd, yn naturiol, â chanolfannau hyfforddiant cychwynnol i athrawon, y cwestiwn gyntaf ydy: a allech chi ehangu ar rôl eich canolfannau mewnol, felly, a sut ydych chi'n derbyn cyfarwyddyd ar faint o athrawon sydd eu hangen ac ym mha bynciau y dylen nhw gael eu hyfforddi?

Dai Lloyd: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for your initial responses there. Specifically, in your role as universities that have initial teacher training centres, the first question is: could you expand upon the role of the ITTCs and how do you take guidance on how many teachers are required and in which subjects they should be trained?

[18] **Mr Tiplady:** Wel, gyda ni fel canolfan, rŷm ni'n gweithio rhwng Prifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd a Phrifysgol De Cymru, ac rŷm ni'n gweithio ar gyrsiau ôl-raddedig yn darparu hyfforddiant i athrawon

Mr Tiplady: Well, as a centre, we work with Cardiff Metropolitan University and the University of South Wales, and we work on postgraduate courses, providing training for secondary and primary teachers. In

uwchradd a chynradd. O ran ein targedau ni ynglŷn â faint rŷm ni i fod i'w cael, mae yna dargedau uwch gyda ni ynglŷn â faint rŷm ni i fod i'w cael yn gyfan gwbl, ond nid oes targedau gyda ni'n benodol am faint ddylai fod yn astudio gyda ni drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. I roi'r niferoedd sydd gyda ni eleni, mae yna 37 gyda ni sy'n astudio naill ai'r pwnc Cymraeg, uwchradd, neu sy'n astudio i fod yn athrawon uwchradd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, nifer da, rŷm ni'n teimlo—nifer eithaf sylweddol o ran nifer y cyrsiau. Ac yn israddedig wedyn, mae 29 gyda ni yn astudio ar gyfer y cyrsiau cynradd.

terms of our targets on how many we need, we have higher targets on how many we're supposed to have completely, but we don't have specific targets on how many should be studying with us through the medium of Welsh. To provide you with the numbers that we have this year, there are 37 studying either the subject of Welsh at secondary level, or studying to be secondary school teachers through the medium of Welsh. So, quite a good figure, we think—quite substantial. And then we have 29 studying on the undergraduate courses at a primary level.

[19] **Mr Jones:** Byddai'n werth imi nodi, efallai, mi fŷm i'n bennaeth y gyfadran addysg ym Mhrifysgol Cymru y Drindod Dewi Sant, neu Goleg y Drindod fel yr oedd e ar y pryd, rhwng 1988 a 2013. Ers hynny, nid wyf wedi bod yn ymwneud â hyfforddi athrawon, ond, yn sicr, mi allaf ddweud, yn gwbl onest, dros yr 20 mlynedd a rhagor y bues i'n ymwneud â'r maes hwn, mi oedd niferoedd hyfforddi athrawon, felly, yn gostwng yn raddol, yn sgil polisïau llywodraethol ac yn y blaen. Ond o ran y cyfrwng Cymraeg, rŷm ni ni fel sefydliad yn teimlo'n reit gryf bod hwn nawr yn gyfle gwirioneddol i'r Llywodraeth ymateb i'r galw, y galw cynyddol am addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac rŷm ni o'r farn, drwy'r broses achredu newydd sydd ar y gorwel, fod yna gyfle euraidd gyda'r broses hon i sicrhau

Mr Jones: It would be worth while noting that I was the head of the education department at the University of Wales Trinity Saint David or Trinity University College as it was at the time, between 1988 and 2013. But, since then, I haven't been involved in teacher training, but, certainly, I can say with some honesty that, over the 20 years where I was involved in this area, the numbers in terms of teacher training were declining gradually, in light of Government policies and so on. But in terms of the Welsh medium, we as an institution feel quite strongly that this is a very real opportunity for the Government to respond to the increasing demand for Welsh-medium education, and we are of the opinion that, through the new accreditation process that's in the pipeline, that there is a golden

na ddylid achredu unrhyw gorff i'r dyfodol nad yw'n gallu gwireddu amcanion y Llywodraeth o ran hyfforddi athrawon cynradd ac athrawon uwchradd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

opportunity through that process to ensure that no body should be accredited in the future that can't achieve the Government's ambitions in terms of training primary and secondary teachers through the medium of Welsh.

[20] Hyn sydd wrth wraidd strategaeth newydd y Llywodraeth ym maes y Gymraeg, ac rwy'n meddwl bod yn rhaid inni dderbyn hynny. Os na chawn ni gyflenwad digonol o athrawon cynradd ac uwchradd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yna wedyn mae'n mynd i fod yn anodd iawn i wireddu holl amcanion y strategaeth. Felly, fel sefydliad, rŷm ni'n teimlo'n gryf bod angen buddsoddiad, bod angen targedau penodol ar y canolfannau a fydd yn cael eu hachredu i'r dyfodol, a bod y capasiti yn y canolfannau hynny i ddarparu a hyfforddi addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, oherwydd os na wnawn ni hynny, mae'n mynd i fod yn o heriol, felly.

This is at the very heart of the Government's new strategy in terms of the Welsh language, and I think we have to accept that, if we don't get an adequate supply of primary and secondary teachers who are able to teach through the medium of Welsh, then it's going to be very, very difficult to achieve all of the objectives of the strategy. So, as an institution, we feel strongly that we need investment and that we need specific targets for the accredited centres in the future, and that the capacity should be in those centres in order to provide and to train for Welsh-medium education, because if we don't do that, then it's going to be very challenging.

[21] I edrych yn ôl ar y gorffennol, ar arferion da, pan gychwynnais i ryw 20 mlynedd, 25 mlynedd yn ôl, mi oedd yna gyrsiau, cyrsiau dwys, yn cael eu cyflwyno ar gyfer athrawon. Cyn cychwyn eu cwrs, bydden nhw'n dod am bythefnos o hyfforddiant dwys yn y Gymraeg—athrawon ar y cwrs TAR cynradd a TAR uwchradd. Rydw i'n meddwl bod yna gyfle i ailedrych ar hynny fel un ffordd o ddenu rhagor o Gymry Cymraeg—y Gymry Cymraeg hynny sydd ychydig

In looking to the past, at good practice in the past, when I started some 20 or 25 years ago, there were intensive courses that were provided for teachers. Before they started their actual course, they would come for a fortnight of intensive Welsh training—teachers on the secondary and primary PGCE course. I think there's an opportunity to look at that anew as one way of attracting more Welsh speakers—those Welsh speakers who are a little reticent;

bach yn betrus; y rheini sydd efallai ddim wedi ystyried mynd i addysgu yn Gymraeg. Hynny yw, eu bod nhw'n siaradwyr Cymraeg ond heb ystyried mynd i addysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yn sicr, rhyw 20 mlynedd yn ôl, mi roedd y system honno'n ennill siaradwyr Cymraeg i'r gorlan er mwyn sicrhau eu bod nhw, ar ddiwedd y cwrs, yn cael eu cymhwyso i addysgu yn y Saesneg neu'r Gymraeg.

those who perhaps haven't considered going into teaching in the Welsh-medium sector. That is, they're Welsh speakers, but they haven't considered the Welsh-medium sector as a career. Certainly, some 20 years ago, that system drew in Welsh speakers to ensure that, at the end of the course, they were qualified to teach both through the medium of English and Welsh.

[22] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae gan Dawn gwestiwn clou ar hwn yn benodol.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Dawn has a quick question on this specifically.

[23] **Dawn Bowden:** I just have a quick question, if I may, around the issue of teacher training. Am I interpreting what you're saying correctly in that you feel that there should be an element of compulsion in terms of study of the Welsh language if somebody wishes to teach in Wales?

[24] **Mr Jones:** Dyna ein barn ni fel sefydliad. Ar gyfer y Cymry Cymraeg, mae angen eu trwytho nhw a rhoi'r hyder yna iddyn nhw i ddysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Ond wedyn, ar gyfer y rhai di-Gymraeg neu prin eu Cymraeg, mae'n rhaid, rhywsut, o fewn y cwrs, cyn y cwrs, ar ôl y cwrs, sicrhau eu bod nhw'n cael eu cyflwyno i'r Gymraeg, hanes y Gymraeg a hanes dwyieithrwydd yng Nghymru, fel eu bod nhw'n deall y cyd-destun dwyieithog y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio ei ddatblygu a'i annog o fewn y strategaeth. Ydw, mi ydw i.

Mr Jones: That's our view as an institution. For the Welsh speakers, there is a need to immerse them and give them the confidence to teach through the medium of Welsh. But then, for those who don't speak Welsh or don't have too much Welsh, there needs to be a way before the course, during the course, after the course, to ensure that they're introduced to the Welsh language, the history of the language and the history of bilingualism in Wales, so that they understand the bilingual context that the Government is trying to develop and encourage within the strategy. So, yes, I do.

[25] **Dawn Bowden:** Okay. That I understand. To follow on from that, this is

an issue for Government, I appreciate, but I would welcome your views on that, because there is a different entry-level standard for teaching in Wales compared to England. I have an example of a member of my own family, a fluent Welsh speaker, who couldn't get into teacher training college in Wales and is now teaching in England, because of the minimum entry standards. He didn't have a B in maths, even though he's not teaching maths. So, do you have view on that, because there is a danger that we are losing Welsh speakers in the profession to England?

[26] **Mr Tiplady:** Fy hunan, rwy'n cytuno â chi. Mae'n rhywbeth mae ein staff ni'n codi'n rheolaidd, sef bod pobl maen nhw'n amlwg yn cwrdd â nhw, yn eu cyfweld, a fyddai'n athrawon da iawn, ond achos bod y lefelau yna'n uwch, maen nhw'n eu colli nhw. Mae yna sgysiau mewnol wedi bod ynglŷn â'r ffaith y gallech chi asesu ar ddiwedd y cyfnod, fel bod cyfle gyda nhw i gael y cymhwyster angenrheidiol erbyn diwedd eu cyfnod nhw fel athrawon yn hytrach na rhoi rhywbeth ar y dechrau. Nid ymateb y sefydliad rwy'n gallu ei roi i hynny, mae'n flin gennyf i, ond fe allaf roi fy ymateb personol a'r ymateb rwyf wedi ei dderbyn oddi wrth y staff, ein bod ni wedi colli mas ar rai athrawon da iawn oherwydd yn gwmws yr esiampl rŷch chi wedi'i rhoi.

Mr Tiplady: Personally, I agree with you. This is something raised regularly by our staff, that there are people who they obviously meet and interview who would make very good teachers, but because those levels are higher, they are lost to the system. There have been some internal discussions around the fact that you could assess at the end of the training period, so that they have that opportunity to gain the necessary qualification by the end of their teacher training, rather than assessing at the beginning. I can't give a response as the institution, I'm afraid, but I can give my personal response and the response that I've heard from staff, that we have lost some very good teachers because of the very example that you've given.

[27] **Bethan Jenkins:** Dai. Diolch.

Bethan Jenkins: Dai, thank you.

[28] **Dai Lloyd:** Ie, diolch, Gadeirydd. Jest i symud ymlaen ychydig bach, a allech chi jest olrhain beth yw'r heriau presennol ynglŷn ag ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg a'r sector addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn naturiol? I fynd yn ôl, y bwriad, yn naturiol, ydy

Dai Lloyd: Yes, thank you, Chair. Just to move on a little, could you just outline what are the current challenges facing Welsh-medium schools and the Welsh-medium education sector naturally? Going back, the intention is to reach 1

cael y 1 miliwn o siaradwyr yma. Rŷch chi wedi rhyw led gyfeirio eisoes eich bod yn disgwyl, fel canolfannau hyfforddiant, derbyn rhyw dargedau ynglŷn â nifer yr athrawon y dylech ddisgwyl eu hyfforddi; ddim jest ei adael o i fyny i chi a faint ŷch chi'n gallu eu denu, ac ati. Ond, yng nghyd-destun hynny, a'r angen yma i gael targedau, a allwch chi olrhain, mewn ychydig bach mwy o ddyfnder, yr heriau presennol yn y sector addysg Gymraeg, a hefyd wrth symud ymlaen? Wrth gwrs, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r twf yma i 1 miliwn o siaradwyr yn mynd i ddigwydd achos bod gennym ni sector addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, felly.

[29] **Mr Tiplady:** A allaf i ddechrau? Diolch yn fawr ichi. Mae yna niferoedd da gennym ni ar hyn o bryd, achos mae yna arian ar gael i hyfforddi trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae'n gyfle gwych i bobl—mae'n swydd dda iawn i fod yn athro. Y '*package*' yw'r gair Cymraeg roeddwn i'n trio edrych amdano, ond yn ffaelu ffeindio fe. Mae'r *package* yn un da. Felly, yr her rwyf i'n teimlo sydd gennym ni ar hyn o bryd, wrth gwrs, yw bod niferoedd eithaf da gennym ni ac mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod ysgolion partner gennym sydd o'r safon angenrheidiol, ac rydym ni'n hapus iawn ac yn ffodus iawn gyda'r ysgolion sy'n gweithio gyda ni. Os ŷm ni'n mynd i gynyddu'n sylweddol o le rŷm ni nawr, pwy yw'r farchnad o fyfyrwyr rŷm ni'n mynd i'w denu? Sut ydym yn mynd i ddod atyn nhw i

million Welsh speakers. You have sort of referred already to the fact that you expect, as training centres, to receive targets with regard to the numbers of teachers you should expect to train; that it won't just be left up to you and how many you could attract, and so on. But, in that context and this need to have targets, could you set out in some depth the current challenges in the Welsh-medium education sector, and also in moving on? Of course, most of this growth towards the 1 million Welsh speakers will happen because we have a Welsh-medium education sector.

Mr Tiplady: If I could start, thank you. We do have good numbers at the moment, because there is funding available for training through the medium of Welsh. It's an excellent opportunity—teaching is a good job. 'Package' is the word I was looking for in Welsh, but couldn't find. The package is a good one. So, the challenge that I feel we have at the moment is that we have relatively good numbers and we need to ensure that we have partner schools that are of the necessary standard, and we are very happy and fortunate with the schools that we work with. If we are going to significantly increase the numbers from where we are now, well, who are the students we're going to attract? How are we going to approach them to attract them teach through the medium of Welsh? And,

ddysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Ac, a fydd yna ddigon o ysgolion i gefnogi'r ddarpariaeth yna i sicrhau lleoliad iddyn nhw?

will there be a sufficient number of schools available to support that provision, so that they have teacher training placements?

[30] Rwy'n cytuno 100 y cant â beth ddywedodd Gwilym. Os ydym yn mynd i gynyddu, mae'n rhaid inni ddenu'r darpar fyfyrwyr hynny sydd ddim yn teimlo'n ddigon hyderus yn eu sgiliau trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a chodi'u sgiliau nhw drwy nifer o wahanol ffyrdd. Dyna un o'r pethau mawr, yr heriau mawr, rwy'n teimlo, sydd eisiau i ni edrych arnynt.

I agree 100 per cent with what Gwilym said. If we are going to increase the numbers, we have to attract those prospective students who currently don't have enough confidence in their Welsh language skills and improve their skills in a number of different ways. That's one of the major challenges that I think we face.

09:30

[31] **Mr Jones:** Os gallaf gyfeirio at un maes ychydig bach yn wahanol, sef maes, ar hyn o bryd, sy'n cael ei alw'n 'Gymraeg ail iaith', a sut rydym yn mynd i gyflwyno'r Gymraeg i siaradwyr di-Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd. Rwy'n meddwl bod yna her wirioneddol i ni fel cenedl ar hyn o bryd i ddenu rhagor o raddedigion y Gymraeg, ac i ddechrau cael rhagor o bobl i astudio Cymraeg fel maes, fel pwnc academiaidd yn y brifysgol, a'u perswadio, neu o leiaf eu hannog nhw, i ystyried gyrfa fel athrawon. Oherwydd os nad oes digon yn astudio'r Gymraeg, i ddechrau ar lefel A felly mewn ysgol, a mynd ymlaen wedyn i astudio'r Gymraeg yn y brifysgol, yna mae'r *pool* hwnnw yn *pool* bychan iawn, iawn. Ac os ydym am weld gwerth ac effaith y strategaeth newydd, mae'n rhaid cael criw sylweddol iawn o athrawon

Mr Jones: If I can just refer to an area that's a little bit different, an area that's called 'Welsh as a second language' at the moment, and how we're going to introduce Welsh to non-Welsh speakers at the moment. I think there is a real challenge for us as a nation there, to attract more Welsh graduates, and to begin to have more people studying Welsh as an academic subject at university level, and persuade them, or at least encourage them, to consider a career as a teacher. If there aren't enough people studying Welsh, initially at A-level in school, and then going on to study Welsh at university level, then that pool is a very, very small pool. And if we want to see value and impact from this new strategy, there is a need for a significant number of Welsh teachers who can teach Welsh speakers and those who don't speak

Cymraeg sy'n medru dysgu'r Cymry Cymraeg a'r rhai di-Gymraeg. Ac, ar hyn o bryd, mae gen i bryder gwirioneddol nad ym ni yn llwyddo i ddenu digon i'r maes hwnnw, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, mae'n rhaid wrth athrawon ysbrydoledig, sydd yn mynd i annog ein pobl ifanc ni i barhau â'u hastudiaethau yn Gymraeg, a theimlo balchder yn yr iaith ac yn nwyieithrwydd ein cenedl ni yn gyffredinol. Felly, mae hwnnw'n un maes.

Welsh. And, at the moment, I have real concern that we're not succeeding in attracting enough to that area, because, ultimately, there is a need for inspirational teachers, who are going to encourage our young people to continue with their studies through the medium of Welsh, and feel pride in the language and in the bilingualism of our nation in general. So, that's one area.

[32] Rwyf am fynd yn ôl hefyd at beth ddywedodd Daniel o ran marchnata. Anghofier y Gymraeg am eiliad, mae marchnata'r proffesiwn addysgu yn rhywbeth y mae angen rhoi sylw dybryd iddo fe yma yng Nghymru, a chodi statws y proffesiwn, oherwydd mae'n broffesiwn gwerthfawr dros ben. Mae'n broffesiwn sydd yn effeithio ar filoedd o unigolion, ac os na chawn ni hwn yn iawn, yna gallai unrhyw strategaeth ddiflannu dros nos mewn gwirionedd.

I want to go back to something Daniel said about marketing. Forget about the Welsh language for a minute—marketing the teaching profession is something that needs attention in Wales, and there's a need to raise the status of the profession in Wales, because it is a very valuable profession. It's a profession that has an impact on thousands of individuals, and if we don't get this right, then any sort of strategy could disappear overnight.

[33] **Dai Lloyd:** Yn dilyn o'ch pwynt olaf chi, a dweud y gwir, dyma'r cwestiwn olaf sydd gen i. Ar ôl i bobl dderbyn hyfforddiant bendigedig i fod yn athrawon yn eich prifysgolion chi, mae yna, wrth gwrs, yn naturiol, bwysau i aros yng Nghymru wedyn. Ac, wrth gwrs, mae yna her sylweddol mewn rhai ardaloedd yng Nghymru i recriwtio athrawon cyfrwng Cymraeg yn y lle cyntaf, ac wedyn i'w cadw nhw, am wahanol resymau. Rydym i

Dai Lloyd: Following on from your final point, this is my final question. Once people have received wonderful training to become teachers at your universities, there is, of course, pressure to remain in Wales. And, of course, there is a significant challenge in some areas of Wales to recruit Welsh-medium teachers initially, and then to retain them, for all sorts of various reasons. We all tend to choose to live in cities these

gyd efallai yn tueddu i fyw mewn dinasoedd y dyddiau hyn, er enghraifft. Ond, o'ch ochr chi, felly, beth fydddech yn gweld fel y ffordd orau o fynd i'r afael efo'r fath her yna? Wedi i ni eu cael nhw a'u hyfforddi nhw, sut wedyn mae eu cadw nhw yma yng Nghymru, fel athrawon Cymraeg yma yng Nghymru?

[34] **Mr Jones:** Mae'n un dasg i'w cadw nhw yng Nghymru. Y dasg arall yw cadw athrawon yn y dosbarth, *full stop* felly. Fel rhywun sydd ag aelodau o'r teulu yn athrawon, ac wedi bod ers blynyddoedd lawer, nid oes rhaid i fi ddweud rhagor wrthyh chi. Mae'n broffesiwn heriol, ond mae'n broffesiwn sy'n rhoi budd a gwerth personol hefyd. Felly, rwy'n meddwl bod angen i'r Llywodraeth yn gyffredinol edrych ar amodau gwaith athrawon, boed yn Gymraeg neu'n Saesneg. Ond, wrth ganolbwyntio ar y Gymraeg am eiliad, rwy'n meddwl bod yn rhaid i ni werthu'r proffesiwn ar gyfer ein pobl ifanc ni fel gyrfa sy'n mynd i wneud gwahaniaeth i Gymru—gyrfa lle gallan nhw fel unigolion wneud gwahaniaeth i blant a phobl ifanc, ond hefyd i greu'r Gymru ddwyieithog, hyderus yma rydym i gyd am ei gweld.

[35] Ac felly rwy'n meddwl, i fynd yn ôl at farchnata eto, fod angen i ni ailedrych ar sut rydym yn marchnata'r proffesiwn. A rwy'n meddwl bydd hynny, o godi statws y proffesiwn, yn fodd o gadw mwy o

days, for example. So, from your point of view, what would you see as the best ways of tackling those challenges? Once we've actually attracted them and trained them, how do we retain them in Wales, as Welsh teachers, or teachers through the medium of Welsh, here in Wales?

Mr Jones: One task is to keep them in Wales, but another task is to keep teachers in the classroom full stop. As somebody who has family members who are teachers, and who have been for many years, I don't have to say any more. It's a challenging profession, but it's a profession that does provide benefits and self-worth as well. So, I think that the Government in general has to look at the terms and conditions of teachers, whether in English or Welsh. But, in concentrating on the Welsh language for a moment, I think we have to sell the profession to our young people as a career that is going to make a difference to Wales—a career where they as individuals can make a difference to children and young people, but also in creating this bilingual, confident Wales that we all want to see.

And, I think, to go back to marketing again, there is a need for us to look again at how we market the profession. And I think that, in raising the status of the profession, will be a means of retaining more

athrawon, a mwy o athrawon yng teachers, and more teachers in Nghymru yn y pen draw. Wales, ultimately.

[36] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae **Bethan Jenkins:** Thanks. Dawn has gan Dawn gwestiynau nawr ynglŷn â questions now about teaching chynorthwywyr addysgu. assistants.

[37] **Dawn Bowden:** Thank you. It may be that this is not an appropriate question for you, actually. We've got the Education Workforce Council coming in afterwards and it may be more appropriate for them. But, we did hear evidence last week from the unions, the teaching unions in particular, about the role of teaching assistants and support staff, and the role that they may have, particularly in early years and one-to-one support in the classrooms. Do you have a view about the role of teaching assistants and support staff in schools, in terms of helping us to get towards the ultimate objective of 1 million speakers?

[38] **Mr Tiplady:** Nid yn rhinwedd fy **Mr Tiplady:** Not in light of my role at swydd ym Met Caerdydd, ond rwyf Cardiff Met, but I'm also chair of hefyd yn gadeirydd llywodraethwyr governors at Ysgol Pencae in Ysgol Pencae yn Llandaf, ac rydym yn Llandaff, and we know that the gwybod bod y cynorthwywyr dysgu teaching assistants are crucial to the yn hollol hanfodol i'r gwaith rydym work that we do as a school. We yn ei wneud fel ysgol. Ni fyddem yn wouldn't succeed without those llwyddo heb y cynorthwywyr dysgu teaching assistants. So, anything that yna. Felly, unrhyw beth y gallwn ni ei we can do to support, develop and wneud i gefnogi, i ddatblygu, i expand that area, I would agree with ehangu'r maes yna, byddwn i yn 100 per cent, because they do cytuno â fe 100 y cant, achos maen wonderful work. nhw'n gwneud gwaith gwych.

[39] **Mr Jones:** A gaf gyfeirio at dri **Mr Jones:** May I refer you to three chynllun rydym ni fel prifysgol wedi schemes that, as a university, we've bod yn rhan ohonyn nhw? Yn gyntaf, been part of? First, there was a roedd cynllun Geiriau Bach a oedd yn scheme called Geiriau Bach, which cael ei gyflwyno dan nawdd was introduced under the Llywodraeth Cymru drwy'r Drindod sponsorship of Welsh Government Dewi Sant, ar draws Cymru, rhyw through Trinity Saint David, across bedair neu bum mlynedd yn ôl, lle Wales, about four or five years ago, roedd yna rai cannoedd o where hundreds of teaching gynorthwywyr dysgu yn cael eu noddi assistants were sponsored by the

gan y Llywodraeth i ddilyn cwrs—cwrs lefel 6, os rwyf yn cofio'n iawn—a oedd yn eu paratoi nhw ar gyfer cyflwyno'r Gymraeg mewn cydestun dwyieithog. Roedd rhai yn siaradwyr Cymraeg a rhai nad oedden nhw yn siarad Gymraeg. Mi oedd hwnnw yn gwrs hynod, hynod o lwyddiannus yn ôl yr adborth a dderbyniwyd. Fe dorwyd y cyllid ac fe orffennodd y cwrs hwnnw, ond mi roedd hwnnw yn llwyddiannus iawn.

Government to follow a course—a level 6 course, if I remember rightly—which prepared them for introducing the Welsh language in a bilingual context. Some were Welsh speakers and others didn't speak Welsh. That was an extremely successful course according to the feedback that was received. Funding was cut, and that course came to an end, but that was very successful.

[40] A gaf i hefyd gyfeirio—

May I also refer—

[41] **Bethan Jenkins:** Pam gafodd y cyllid ei dorri?

Bethan Jenkins: Why was the funding cut?

[42] **Mr Jones:** Daeth y cytundeb i ben—

Mr Jones: The contract came to an end.

[43] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jest wnaeth e ddod i ben.

Bethan Jenkins: It just came to an end.

[44] **Mr Jones:** Do, daeth y cytundeb i ben ac wedyn fe ddiflannodd y rhaglen, fel petai. Ond fe hyfforddwyd rhyw 300 neu 400 o gynorthwywyr dysgu ar draws Cymru i gyd.

Mr Jones: Yes, the contract came to an end and then the scheme disappeared, so to speak. But about 300 or 400 teaching assistants across Wales were trained.

[45] Yn ail, wedyn, eto fel prifysgol rydym yn cynnig gradd sylfaen—cwrs dwy flynedd—ar gyfer cynorthwywyr dysgu ar draws de-orllewin Cymru a chanolbarth Cymru. Mae rhai o'n staff ni yn addysgu mor bell â'r Trallwng, y Drenewydd, sir Benfro, Aberystwyth a Chaerfyrddin, ac yn y blaen, lle rydym ni yn cyflwyno y cynorthwywyr dysgu yma i faterion yn

Secondly, again as a university we offer a foundation degree—a two-year course—for teaching assistants across south-west Wales and mid Wales. Some of our staff teach as far away as Welshpool, Newtown, Pembrokeshire, Aberystwyth and Carmarthen, and so forth, where we introduce these teaching assistants to issues relating to education, and

ymwneud ag addysg, ac addysg gynhwysol yn benodol. Rydym ni wedi cynnig llwybr iddyn nhw wedyn i raddio drwy astudio am flwyddyn ychwanegol yn y brifysgol. Beth sydd wedi bod yn wirioneddol wych yw gweld rhai o'r cynorthwyr dysgu yma yn dilyn y llwybr yma ac yn graddio, ac yn mynd ymlaen i wneud cwrs TAR cynradd, ac yn mynd ymlaen i fod yn athrawon. Mae gweld y rhain yn dilyn y llwybr hwnnw ac yn cyrraedd eu nod o fod yn athrawon yn rhywbeth go arbennig. Felly, mae hwnnw'n amlwg wedi gweithio.

inclusive education specifically. We've offered them a pathway then to graduate by studying for an extra year at the university. What has been wonderful is seeing some of these teaching assistants following this pathway and graduating, and going on to do a PGCE primary course and becoming teachers. To see them following this pathway and reaching their aim of becoming teachers is something quite special. So, that clearly has worked.

[46] A'r drydedd raglen rwyf am gyfeirio ati yw'r cwrs sabothol. Mae'r Drindod Dewi Sant yn arwain y maes hwn o safbwynt cyrsiau sabothol ar gyfer cynorthwyr dysgu, a chredwch chi fi, mae'r cwrs hwnnw yn gweithio. Mae'r adborth y tu hwnt o ffafriol gan athrawon a'r cynorthwyr dysgu. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig fanna yw, unwaith eu bod nhw'n gorffen y cwrs, maen nhw'n mynd nôl i'r ystafell ddosbarth lle maen nhw'n llawer mwy hyderus yn cyflwyno'r Gymraeg ac yn cefnogi'r athrawon yn Gymraeg mewn cydestun dwyieithog, ond bod yna ôl-ofalaeth; hynny yw, bod yr ysgolion ar ôl eu cefnogi nhw yn sicrhau bod yr isadeiledd yno i'w cefnogi nhw ymhellach yn ôl yn y dosbarth. Efallai mai dyna lle mae angen gweithio ymhellach ar y cwrs hwnnw ar hyn o bryd. Ond mae nifer o gyfleoedd lle rydym ni fel prifysgol wedi bod yn rhan ohonyn nhw i ymateb i'r

And the third scheme I want to refer to is the sabbatical course. Trinity St David is leading in this field of sabbatical courses for teaching assistants, and believe you me, that course works. The feedback is very favourable from teachers and the teaching assistants. What's important there is that once they complete the course, they go back to the classroom where they're much more confident in introducing Welsh and supporting the teachers through the medium of Welsh in a bilingual context, but that there is aftercare; that is, that the schools ensure that the infrastructure is there to support them further back in the classroom. Perhaps that's where there is a need for more work on that course at the moment. But there are a number of opportunities where, as a university, we've been part of them to respond to this increasing emphasis on the role of teaching assistants in the

pwyslais cynyddol sydd ar rôl y classroom.
cynorthwydd dosbarth yn yr ystafell
ddosbarth.

[47] **Dawn Bowden:** And what—. Sorry, Chair; just one more question. What's been the experience in the schools? Have the teaching assistants and support staff been released from their duties during working time to do this course, because that's one of the barriers of course?

[48] **Mr Jones:** Dyna chi. Mae'r brifysgol yn gweithio gyda'r awdurdod lleol i adnabod unigolion y tybir y byddan nhw'n elwa'n sylweddol o ddarpariaeth o'r fath. Maen nhw'n cael eu rhyddhau gan yr ysgol, ac yna mae'r Llywodraeth wedyn, yn ôl beth rwy'n ddeall, yn talu am arian cyflenwi i sicrhau bod yna gyflenwi yn y dosbarth tra bod y person yna i ffwrdd am dri mis, rwy'n meddwl.

Mr Jones: That's right. The university works with the local authority to identify individuals who it's believed would benefit significantly from such provision. They are released by the school, and then the Government, as I understand it, pays for backfilling or supply provision in order to ensure that there are supply teachers whilst that person is away for some three months, I believe.

[49] **Bethan Jenkins:** Daniel, a ydych chi eisiau dod mewn ar hynny?

Bethan Jenkins: Daniel, did you want to come in there?

[50] **Mr Tiplady:** Os ydym ni yn edrych i farchnata addysgu a phwysigrwydd athrawon, elfen gref o hynny ddylai fod marchnata pwysigrwydd cynorthwywyr dysgu, achos maen nhw'n hollbwysig i beth mae'r athrawon yn gallu ei gyflawni, a hebddyn nhw fyddai hynny ddim yn bosibl.

Mr Tiplady: If we're looking to market teaching and the importance of teachers, then an important element of that is to market the importance of teaching assistants, because they are crucial to what the teachers can deliver, and without them it simply wouldn't be possible.

[51] Un o'r problemau sydd ar hyn o bryd yw bod nhw'n cael eu gweld o bosibl fel swyddi statws yn is. Er enghraifft, yn y *destination of leavers from higher education survey*, lle rydym ni'n edrych fel prifysgolion ar

One of the problems that exists at the moment is that they are possibly seen as lower status roles. For example, in the destinations of leavers from higher education survey, which is what we look at as

ble mae'n graddedigion ni yn mynd, nid yw swydd cynorthwyydd dysgu yn cael ei hystyried fel swydd lefel graddedigion. Mae'n cael ei hystyried yn swydd lefel is, er eu bod nhw'n hollbwysig i lwyddiant ysgolion. Felly, mae eisiau edrych ar statws y rôl wrth farchnata'r peth yn gyffredinol, a marchnata eu pwysigrwydd nhw.

universities in terms of where our graduates go, a teaching assistant post isn't considered to be a graduate level post. It's seen as a lower level post, although they are crucially important to the success of schools. So, we need to look at the status of the role in marketing more generally, and marketing the importance of that role.

[52] **Dawn Bowden:** And the registration—*[Inaudible.]*

[53] **Mr Tiplady:** Yes. Definitely.

[54] **Dawn Bowden:** Okay, thank you.

[55] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. Hannah.

[56] **Hannah Blythyn:** We talked about the need to recruit more people to be able to teach through the medium of Welsh, but in the short to medium term we're probably going to be looking at needing to upskill the teachers we already have to enable them to be more confident to teach through the medium of Welsh. In your view, what capacity is there within the sector to upskill, and what do you see the challenges are in doing that?

[57] **Mr Tiplady:** Gyda ni, rŷm ni'n cynnig, mae cynllun colegau yn rhedeg, sef bod pob person sy'n astudio addysg gyda ni—hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon—yn gorfod gwneud elfen o'r Gymraeg. Mae 85 y cant o'n myfyrwyr ni yn dod o Gymru, felly, mae gyda nhw TGAU, neu hanner TGAU neu TGAU ail iaith—mae rhywbeth gyda nhw yn barod. Felly, rydym ni'n gweithio gyda nhw er mwyn sicrhau bod y Gymraeg achlysurol gyda nhw iddyn nhw allu defnyddio: 'bore da'—*good morning*—a'r lliwiau ac yn y blaen, ac

Mr Tiplady: With us, we offer a scheme that colleges run, that everybody who studies education—initial teacher training—with us has to do an element of Welsh. Eighty five per cent of our students come from Wales, so they have a GCSE or half a GCSE or second-language GCSE—they have something already. So, we work with them in order to ensure that they have incidental Welsh that they can use: 'bore da'—good morning—and the colours and so on. So, we ensure that there is a baseline there. Myself, I think that this cohort

yn y blaen. Felly, rydym ni yn sicrhau fod yna waelodlin yna. Rwyf fi fy hun yn teimlo fod y garfan hon yn un hollbwysig, os ydym ni'n mynd i drio cyrraedd ein targed ni i godi sgil a safon Cymraeg y rhain.

is vital if we're going to try to reach our target to upskill and improve the standard of these people's Welsh.

[58] Mae hwnnw'n rhywbeth heriol, achos mae'r flwyddyn o'r cyrsiau TAR yn flwyddyn hir, anodd a llawn ac felly mae unrhyw beth ychwanegol sydd yn mynd i fod yn y flwyddyn hynny yn mynd i fod yn rhywbeth anodd. Felly, rwy'n credu bod eisiau inni edrych ar gynlluniau fel y cynlluniau sabothol, ac fel y cynlluniau ychwanegol ar ben hynny, er mwyn codi sgiliau pobl, achos mae yna lefel o sgil yna, wrth iddyn nhw ein cyrraedd ni—TGAU ail iaith neu TGAU sydd yna. Rŷm ni'n cynyddu'r rheini hyd at ryw bwynt, ond dim digon fel eu bod nhw'n gallu weithio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, mae fe'n un o'r heriau mawr sydd gyda ni.

That is challenging, because the year of PGCE courses is a difficult, long and full year and so anything that's additional in that year is going to be difficult. So, I think we need to look at schemes like the sabbatical schemes, and like the additional schemes on top of that, in order to upskill people, because there is a level of skill there, when they reach us—they have second-language GCSE or GCSE. We're increasing those skills up to a certain point, but not sufficiently for them to be able to work through the medium of Welsh. So, it is one of the great challenges that we have.

[59] **Mr Jones:** I fynd yn ôl at un o'r cwestiynau blaenorol, mae angen sicrhau bod pob un myfyriwr sydd wedi ei hyfforddi yng Nghymru i fod yn athro neu'n athrawes yn cael dealltwriaeth o'r Gymraeg, ond hefyd yn cael cyfle gwirioneddol i ddysgu'r Gymraeg at ryw lefel, boed cynradd neu uwchradd. Yr unig ffordd rydym ni'n mynd i wneud hynny yw sicrhau, o fewn y cwricwlwm newydd—pan fyddem ni yn ymateb i Donaldson a'i adroddiad—bod y cwricwlwm newydd yng Nghymru yn adlewyrchu'r Gymru rydym ni'n deisyfu yn y strategaeth.

Mr Jones: To return to a previous question, we need to ensure that every student trained in Wales to become a teacher has an understanding of the Welsh language, but also a real opportunity to learn the language to some level, be that primary or secondary. The only way we can do that is to ensure that, within the new curriculum—when we respond to the Donaldson report—the new curriculum in Wales reflects the Wales that we are aspiring towards in the strategy. This is the major opportunity and so,

Hwn yw'r cyfle mawr ac felly o fewn rhaglen waith hyfforddi cynradd ac uwchradd, mae angen lle canolog i'r Gymraeg, boed ar gyfer Cymry Cymraeg sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn rhugl, y dysgwyr da, neu'r rheini sydd heb unrhyw syniadaeth am y Gymraeg, fel bod pawb yn cael cyfle i berchnogi'r iaith a chymryd balchder yn yr iaith Gymraeg. Dyna'r pwynt gyntaf, yn sicr.

within the work programme for primary and secondary training, the Welsh language needs a central role, be that for fluent Welsh speakers, confident learners, or those who have no concept of the Welsh language, so that everyone can take ownership of the Welsh language and take pride in the Welsh language. That's the first point, certainly.

[60] Yr ail bwynt wedyn: rwyf am fynd yn ôl at y cynllun sabothol. Dyma i chi gynllun; mae'n gynllun drud, mae'n gynllun uchelgeisiol, ond mae'n gynllun sy'n gweithio. Hoffwn i eich bod chi, fel pwyllgor, yn edrych ar yr impact y mae'r cynllun sabothol yma yn ei gael ar athrawon a chynorthwyrwyr dysgu. Rydw i'n meddwl ei fod yn gyfle i'r Llywodraeth i ystyried datblygu hwn ymhellach, nid yn unig ar gyfer athrawon, ond ar gyfer meysydd eraill sy'n ymwneud â'r strategaeth. Nid ydych chi efallai am gyffwrdd â nhw heddiw, ond rydych chi yn sôn am iechyd a gofal a maes hamdden ac yn y blaen hefyd.

The second point then: I want to return to the sabbatical scheme. This is an expensive programme, it is an ambitious programme, but it is a programme that works. I would like you, as a committee, to look at the impact that the sabbatical programme has on teachers and teaching assistants. I think there's an opportunity for the Government to develop this further, not only for teachers, but also in others areas related to the strategy. You may not want to touch upon them today, but you're talking about health and care and leisure and so on and so forth too.

[61] Yr unig ffordd y mae rhywun yn mynd i ddysgu'r iaith yw trwy gael dwyster yn y dysgu, dwyster profiad ac yna cyfle wedyn i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y gweithle gyda chefnogaeth y cyflogwr yn y pendraw. Felly, mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr wyf i'n credu'n gryf iawn, iawn. Mae'r cynllun yn gweithio ac mae cyfle gwirioneddol i'w ddatblygu

The only way one is going to learn the language is to have an intensity of learning, of experience and then an opportunity to use the Welsh language in the workplace with the support of the employer ultimately. So, that is something that I believe very, very strongly in. The scheme works and there is a real opportunity to develop it further, with further

ymhellach gyda buddsoddiad pellach investment as well.
hefyd.

[62] **Mr Tiplady:** Rwy'n cytuno 100 y cant â Gwilym yn fanna. Yr amser, wrth gwrs, yw'r peth. O ble mae'r amser yn dod? Sut y mae pobl yn cael eu rhyddhau i ddefnyddio'r amser yna? Ond rwy'n cytuno. Heb rywbeth o'r fath, allem ni ddim cael y cynnydd sylweddol sydd ei eisiau. Ond y tu fewn i'r flwyddyn sydd gyda ni'n barod—os oes lle yna; nid wyf yn credu fy hunain bod yna—mae'n rhaid edrych ar sut y gallem ni rhyddhau staff a sut y gallem ni annog pobl i fynd ar hyd y trywydd yna. Rwy'n credu bod hwnnw'n hollbwysig wrth edrych i gynllunio ar gyfer rhywbeth fel y cynllun sabothol.

Mr Tiplady: I agree 100 per cent with Gwilym there, but time, of course, is the thing. Where is the time going to come from? How are people going to be released to use that time? But I agree. Without such a scheme, we can't see the significant increase that is needed. But within the year that we have already—if there is room there; I don't think personally that there is—we need to look at how we are going to release staff and how we're going to encourage them to follow that route. I think that's vital as we look at planning for something like the sabbatical scheme.

[63] **Mr Jones:** Gadeirydd, os gallaf godi un pwynt arall: fel sefydliad sydd wedi bod ynghlwm â sefydlu'r Ganolfan Dysgu Cymraeg Cenedlaethol yn ddiweddar, rwyf yn teimlo fod lle i'r ganolfan hon yn awr, sydd yn arwain maes Cymraeg i oedolion, i ymgysylltu ei hun â'r holl weithgarwch sy'n digwydd yn yr ysgolion uwchradd ac yn y blaen fel bod dilyniant a chyfleon i'r athrawon hefyd ystyried cyrsiau dysgu o bell ac yn y blaen drwy'r ganolfan newydd hon. Rwy'n ymwybodol bod y ganolfan yn edrych ar sawl ffordd wahanol o gyflwyno'r Gymraeg i'r gweithle yn y dyfodol ac felly bydd cyfle i'r ganolfan honno hefyd rwy'n meddwl i gael mewnbwn yn y pendraw i'r modd y mae athrawon a

Mr Jones: Chair, if I can just add one further point: as an institution that was involved in the establishment of the National Centre for Learning Welsh recently, I do think that there is role for that centre, which is leading in Welsh for adults, to engage with all of the activities happening in the secondary schools and so on so that there is a continuum and an opportunity for teachers to consider distance learning courses and so on through this new centre. I'm aware that the centre is looking at a number of different ways of introducing the Welsh language into the workplace in future and there will be an opportunity therefore for that centre to have an input ultimately in the way

chynorthwyon dysgu yn datblygu'r that teachers and teaching assistants
Gymraeg. develop their skills.

[64] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan Suzy **Bethan Jenkins:** Suzy has a brief
gwestiwn clou, os yw hynny'n iawn, question, if that's okay, Hannah.
Hannah.

[65] **Suzy Davies:** Yes. I'm going to ask you some questions about
progression later on, but with regard to the teachers—I'm not talking about
teachers who are either confident learners or already have Welsh-language
skills—who have taken the great psychological leap from a non-Welsh
background to really go for this and teach through the medium of Welsh, you
mentioned that there are issues of time and that the *cwrs sabothol* is
expensive. Where would you see the gaps in the continuum for the Welsh-
learner teacher themselves arising? Because somebody may come into this
with all the best intentions in the world and practicalities get in the way.
Apart from time, what do you think those barriers might be?

09:45

[66] **Mr Jones:** Os edrychwch chi ar **Mr Jones:** If you look at the Basque
Wlad y Basg, mae yna fuddsoddiad Country, there has been a substantial
sylweddol o ran amser ac adnoddau. investment in terms of time and
Wrth edrych yn ôl—mae'n rhwydd resources. Looking back—perhaps
edrych yn ôl, ond pan fyddem ni'n it's easy to look back, but when we're
paratoi athrawon i ddysgu yn y preparing teachers to teach through
Saesneg ond gydag elfen o Gymraeg the medium of English but with an
yng Nghymru, rydym ni wedi gadael element of Welsh in Wales, we have
yr athrawon i fod, i fynd ymlaen â'u left those teachers to carry on with
busnes eu hunain, heb yr their business, without this
hyfforddiant parhaus hwnnw. Yng continuous training. In the Basque
Ngwlad y Basg, mae yna hyfforddiant Country, there is continuous training
parhaus i'r athrawon hynny sy'n for those teachers who are teaching
dysgu'r iaith. through the medium of Basque.

[67] **Suzy Davies:** Ble mae hynny'n **Suzy Davies:** Where does this
digwydd? A ydy hyn yn digwydd yn yr happen? Does it happen in the
ysgolion eu hunain neu a oes yn schools themselves or do the
rhaid i'r athrawon ddod mas o'r ysgol teachers have to come out of school
i gael y cymorth yna? to get that support?

[68] **Mr Jones:** Wel, eto, wrth edrych ar y gwahanol systemau posibl yng Nghymru—. Mae yna strategaethau sirol, wrth gwrs, gan yr awdurdodau lleol. Mi ddylai hyn fod yn rhan o waith cefnogi'r siroedd, wedyn, yn y dosbarth ac ar draws y sir, mewn gwirionedd. Unwaith mae'r athrawon yn cael eu cymhwyso ac yn gadael y colegau i fynd i dysgu yna, rydych chi'n trosglwyddo'r awenau i'r awdurdod addysg lleol, mewn gwirionedd. Felly, mae angen, rwy'n teimlo, mwy o gydweithio rhwng y sefydliadau sy'n hyfforddi'r athrawon yn gychwynnol ac yna'r awdurdodau sydd yn cymryd y rôl o'u datblygu ymhellach.

Mr Jones: Well, again, looking at the different possible systems in Wales—. There are strategies on a county level, of course, with the local authorities. This should be part of supporting the county councils, then, in the classroom and across the county, in reality. Once the teachers are qualified and leave the colleges to go into teaching, then, really, you're transferring the reins to the local education authority. So, there is a need, I think, for more collaboration between the institutions that train the teachers initially and then the authorities that take on the role of developing them further.

[69] Mae gormod o raniadau yn y system ar hyn o bryd. Dylai fod yna gontinwwm hyfforddi lle mae pawb yn cydweithio'n llawer, llawer agosach. Felly, i ateb eich cwestiwn chi, fe ddylai fod yna hyfforddiant parhaus yn y dosbarth ond hefyd, drwy'r Ganolfan Dysgu Cymraeg Genedlaethol, dylai fod yna gyfle i ddysgu'r Gymraeg a chryfhau'r Gymraeg drwy ddulliau dysgu o bell hefyd. Mae angen i bobl weithio'n agosach gyda'i gilydd. Llawer mwy o gydweithio, tybiwn i—dyna'r ateb yn y pen draw.

There are too many gaps in the system. There should be a training continuum where people collaborate much more. So, to answer your question, there should be more CPD in the classroom but also, through the National Centre for Learning Welsh, there should be an opportunity to learn Welsh and strengthen the Welsh language through distance learning, for example. There is a need for people to work closer together. Much more collaboration, I would think—that's the answer, ultimately.

[70] **Suzy Davies:** Océ. Diolch.

Suzy Davies: Okay. Thank you.

[71] **Bethan Jenkins:** Hannah.

[72] **Hannah Blythyn:** One final question: do you have a view on the number of additional teachers to teach through the medium of Welsh that are going

to be needed in the long term to meet this objective?

[73] **Mr Tiplady:** Mae'n flin gyda fi, nid wyf yn gwybod faint y bydd eu heisiau. Ond fe allaf gredu, i gael 100,000 ychwanegol o siaradwyr bob 10 mlynedd, os oes lot o'r rheini drwy'r system addysg, mae'r nifer yn mynd i fod yn sylweddol. Ond mae'n flin gyda fi, nid oes gyda fi syniad faint.

Mr Tiplady: No, sorry, I don't know how many would be required. But I would have thought, to get an additional 100,000 Welsh speakers every 10 years, if much of that is through the education system, the number is going to be high. But I'm sorry, I don't have any idea of the exact number.

[74] **Mr Jones:** Nid oes gennyf innau chwaith, yn anffodus. Dim ond i nodi bod angen cynnydd sylweddol a'r unig ffordd yr ŷch chi'n mynd i sicrhau hynny o ran y sefydliadau a'r canolfannau a phwy bynnag sy'n cael eu hachredu yn y dyfodol yw targedau. Hynny yw, mae'r niferoedd wedi aros yn eithaf cyson ers 20 mlynedd a rhagor. Mae angen nawr newid gêr, a'r unig ffordd yr ydych chi'n mynd i wneud hynny, a mynnu fod y canolfannau sy'n cael eu hachredu yn gwneud hynny, yw targedu penodol.

Mr Jones: I don't know either, unfortunately. I just want to note that we need a significant increase and the only way that you're going to secure that in terms of the institutions and the centres and whoever is accredited in the future is to have targets. The numbers have remained quite stable for some 20 years and more. We now need a change of gear, and the only way that you can do that, and insist that the accredited centres do that, is through specific targeting.

[75] **Bethan Jenkins:** A fydddech chi eisiau cael trafodaeth ynglŷn â'r targedau yn hytrach na fod y Llywodraeth yn dweud wrthyich chi beth fyddai'r targed i chi? Er enghraifft, mae'r Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin wedi dweud wrthym ni faint yn fwy o blant y byddai angen iddyn nhw allu gwireddu rhyw fath o darged. A fyddai gennych chi ryw fath o arbenigedd ynglŷn â faint, o fewn y capasiti ar hyn o bryd, y bydddech chi'n gallu gwneud heb fwy

Bethan Jenkins: Would you want to have a discussion about the targets rather than the Government telling you what the target would be for you? For example, Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin have told us how many more children would be needed for them to be able to realise some sort of target. Would you have some expertise regarding how many, within the capacity you have at the moment, you could train with the money you have now? Or would you require

o arian? Neu a fyddai angen mwy o arian beth bynnag er mwyn i chi allu gwireddu rhyw fath o darged y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn rhoi arnoch chi?

more money in order for you to realise some sort of target that the Government would place on you?

[76] **Mr Jones:** Fe fyddem ni'n mawr obeithio fod y drafodaeth sydd wastad wedi bod rhwng y sefydliadau a'r Llywodraeth, neu wedi bod yn y gorffennol â'r cyngor cyllido, yn parhau, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, drwy gydweithio mae cyrraedd y nod, yn sicr.

Mr Jones: We would very much hope that the discussions that have always taken place between the institutions and the Government, or have been in the past with the funding council, would continue, because, ultimately, collaboration is the way we're going to achieve this.

[77] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ond, er enghraifft, rydych chi wedi ei ddweud nad oes targedau ar gyfer medru'r Gymraeg. A ydych chi wedi dweud hynny wrth y Llywodraeth ac wedi dweud hynny wrth Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru yn y gorffennol, am y ffaith nad oes yna darged?

Bethan Jenkins: But, for example, you've said there are no targets for people who can speak Welsh. Have you said this to the Government and have you said this to HEFCW in the past, about the fact that there isn't a target?

[78] **Mr Tiplady:** Ydym. Rydym wedi, fel sefydliad, gwneud hynny.

Mr Tiplady: As an institution, we have, yes.

[79] **Bethan Jenkins:** A beth yw'r ymateb, wedyn, ganddyn nhw?

Bethan Jenkins: And what's been their response to that?

[80] **Mr Jones:** Yn gyffredinol, rwy'n meddwl fy mod i'n iawn i ddweud nad yw'r cyngor cyllido, hyd yn hyn, wedi bod yn ffafrio targedau.

Mr Jones: Generally speaking, I think it's right to say that the funding council, so far, hasn't favoured targets.

[81] **Bethan Jenkins:** Pam?

Bethan Jenkins: Why?

[82] **Mr Jones:** Nid wyf yn hollol sicr. Gallwch ofyn iddyn nhw, felly. Ond, yn sicr, mae'n rhaid newid gêr. Os yw'r strategaeth yma i ddwyn

Mr Jones: I couldn't tell you. You'd have to ask them. But, certainly, we need a gear shift. If this strategy is to succeed, and if the Government

ffrwyth, ac os yw'r Llywodraeth am weld Cymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog, mae'n rhaid sicrhau mwy o athrawon sy'n gymwys i ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yr unig ffordd rydych chi yn mynd i newid sefydliadau unigol a chanolfannau unigol yw drwy osod targedau ychydig bach yn fwy uchelgeisiol na'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

wants to see a truly bilingual Wales, then we must ensure that we have more teachers qualified to teach through the medium of Welsh. The only way you're going to change individual institutions and individual centres is by setting more ambitious targets than we currently have.

[83] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan Jeremy gwestiwn clou cyn i ni symud ymlaen.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy has a brief question before we move on.

[84] **Jeremy Miles:** Jest ar y cwestiwn o dargedau, sut byddech chi'n gweld proffil y targedau yma? A ydych chi'n meddwl y byddai angen cynnydd yn syth i lefelau uwch o dargedu, neu a fydddech chi'n gweld cynnydd graddol yn digwydd dros gyfnod? A oes gyda chi rhywbeth mewn golwg ynglŷn â'r math o batrwm y byddai angen ei weld er mwyn cyflenwi'r ddarpariaeth sydd ei hangen?

Jeremy Miles: Just on this question of targets, how would you see the profile of these targets? Do you think there would be a need for an immediate increase to higher levels of targeting, or would you anticipate a gradual increase over a period of time? Do you have anything in mind about the sort of pattern that we would need to see in order to supply the provision that we need?

[85] **Mr Jones:** Bydd angen ymateb yn raddol i gychwyn tybiwn i, oherwydd yn amlwg mae angen digon o staff yn y sefydliadau sy'n gallu addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, hynny yw, hyfforddi'r darpar athrawon drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, mae'n rhaid i'r newid fod yn raddol i gychwyn ond gyda'r nod, o fewn pump i 10 mlynedd, fod y canolfannau yma yn ganolfannau gwirioneddol ddwyieithog.

Mr Jones: We will need a gradual response initially, I think, because clearly you need enough staff in the institutions who are able to train prospective teachers through the medium of Welsh. So, the change has to be gradual initially but with the aim, within five or 10 years, that these centres should be truly bilingual centres.

[86] **Jeremy Miles:** Ocê. Diolch.

Jeremy Miles: Okay. Thank you.

[87] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Neil **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you. Neil Hamilton.

[88] **Neil Hamilton:** My question follows on naturally from Suzy's line of questions a moment ago and it's really about the culture and mindset of local authorities and the education sector generally in Wales towards the provision of Welsh language education. I'd like to get your views on the variability that you've encountered in the course of your professional lives, not with the view of naming and shaming necessarily—identifying individual authorities that might be more or less open to the Government's stated objective and achieving it—but your general views on what more needs to be done either with local authorities or within your own sector of education in order to bring about what we all want to see by 2050.

[89] **Mr Jones:** Wel, mae angen symud ysgolion ar hyd y continwwm ieithyddol er mwyn cynyddu'r cyflenwad o leoedd ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae hynny'n ffaith, ac felly rydw i'n meddwl bod lle gan y Llywodraeth i annog a chefnogi'r awdurdodau hynny sydd yn dymuno gweld hynny'n digwydd o fewn eu tiriogaeth nhw. Nid ydw i am fanylu ar unrhyw sir yn benodol, ond mae yna achosion yng Nghymru heddiw efallai lle y mae angen yr hwb yna ar yr awdurdodau ac ar yr ysgolion i newid. Felly, gydag ychydig bach yn fwy o gefnogaeth, rwy'n meddwl y bydd modd cael y maen i'r wal i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, rwy'n meddwl. Ond, yn sicr, mae angen cefnogaeth ar yr awdurdodau hynny sydd yn barod i symud ysgolion ar hyd y continwwm.

Mr Jones: Well, we do need to move schools along the linguistic continuum if we are to increase the supply of Welsh-medium school places. That's a fact, and I think that the Government does have a role in encouraging and supporting those authorities that want to see that happening within their territories. I'm not going to name names or mention any counties, but there are cases in Wales today where perhaps they need that push, the authorities and the schools need that push for change. So, with a little more support, I think it would be possible to achieve our aims in this area. But, certainly, there needs to be support for those authorities who are ready to move schools along that continuum.

[90] **Mr Tiplady:** Dim ond i ategu hynny, os ydym ni'n mynd i ddyblu faint o siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd gyda ni, yn amlwg, mae'n rhaid bod

Mr Tiplady: I just want to endorse that. If we're going to double the number of Welsh speakers that we have then, clearly, there is a need for

cynnydd yn nifer yr ysgolion Cymraeg. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, mae eisiau anogaeth ar yr awdurdodau lleol i symud pethau ymlaen. Eto, liciwn i ddim nodi yn benodol unrhyw un, ond mae yn braf gweld y twf mewn addysg Gymraeg sydd wedi bod yng Nghaerdydd dros y blynyddoedd yna. Mae'r nifer yn cynyddu ac mae'n braf i'w weld.

an increase in the number of Welsh-medium schools. To do that, there is a need to encourage local authorities to move things on. Again, I wouldn't like to identify any authorities specifically, but it is great to see the growth in Welsh-medium education in Cardiff over the years. The numbers are increasing and it's great to see.

[91] **Neil Hamilton:** The other interesting question is the re-categorisation of schools—how you move along the continuum from being English language to bilingual, from bilingual to Welsh-medium—and the practical problems that are involved in that. I'd like to get your views on the situation as it is at the minute in terms of re-categorisation and what more we can do to speed that process along.

[92] **Mr Tiplady:** Nid oes gennyf i ddim profiad fy hun o gategoreiddio—dim ond rhywbeth allanol rwyf wedi'i weld yn digwydd. Ond, fel ymateb i'r cwestiwn y gofynnodd Jeremy, rhywbeth sy'n mynd i ddigwydd dros gyfnod yw e i ddechrau, fel symud categorïau ysgol i fod yn rhai dwyieithog. Nid ydyn nhw'n dargedau uchel, rwy'n credu, y gallwn ni eu cyrraedd dros nos—ond gallem ni efallai, fel rhan o'r targedau ychwanegol i athrawon, targedau ychwanegol i ysgolion, symud tuag at fynd ar hyd y continwwm. Felly, mae'n flin gyda fi—rwy'n rhywun o'r tu fas yn edrych i mewn. Rwy'n credu ei fod yn rhywbeth positif ond rhywbeth sy'n digwydd yn araf bach yw e, nid rhywbeth a fyddai'n gallu digwydd dros nos, os mai newid statws ysgol rŷm ni'n sôn amdano yn hytrach na chreu ysgolion newydd.

Mr Tiplady: I don't have any experience myself of categorisation—I've only seen something happening on an external level. But, in responding to the question that Jeremy asked, it's something that's going to happen over a period, initially, as is the re-categorisation of schools to be bilingual. They're not high targets that we can reach overnight—but, we could perhaps, as part of the additional targets for teachers, additional targets for schools, move towards going along the continuum. So, I apologise—I'm somebody from the outside looking in. I do think it's something that's positive, but it is happening quite slowly and it won't happen overnight, if it's changing the status of a school that we're talking about rather than creating new schools.

[93] **Mr Jones:** Yn sicr, mae angen arweiniad pellach ynghylch sut i gategoreiddio ysgolion o ran iaith. Rwy'n meddwl bod hynny'n cael ei nodi'n glir yn adroddiad Comisiynydd y Gymraeg. Hefyd, mae'n codi cwestiynau difrifol efallai am y modd y mae ysgolion nad ydyn nhw yn rhai cyfrwng Cymraeg yn cyfrannu yn y pen draw i'r strategaeth Gymraeg sy'n cael ei datblygu gan y Llywodraeth. Hynny yw, rŷm ni'n sôn bod y Gymraeg yn perthyn i ni i gyd ac mae'r Gymraeg yn perthyn i bawb; mae hynny'n allweddol, allweddol bwysig. Felly, mae rôl gan bob ysgol, beth bynnag yw ei chefnidir ieithyddol hi, i gyfrannu at greu y Gymru ddwyieithog yma rydym ni'n ei deisyfu. Felly, efallai bod angen ychydig bach yn fwy o sylw ar y modd y mae ysgolion yn cael eu categororeiddio, achos weithiau mae hynny, yn amlwg, yn gallu achosi gwrthdaro lle nad oes angen y gwrthdaro hwnnw mewn gwirionedd.

Mr Jones: Certainly, there needs to be further guidance on how to categorise schools in linguistic terms. I think that's clearly noted in the Welsh Language Commissioner's report. Also, it raises some serious questions perhaps about the way in which non-Welsh-medium schools contribute ultimately to the Welsh language strategy being developed by Government. We always say that the Welsh language belongs to all of us, and that's true and it's crucially important. Therefore, every school, whatever its linguistic background, has a role in contributing towards this bilingual Wales that we all want to see. So, perhaps we need to focus a little more on the way schools are categorised, because on occasion that can cause conflict where there is no need for that conflict, if truth be told.

[94] **Bethan Jenkins:** Lee, did you want to come in on that one?

[95] **Lee Waters:** Yes, I'd just like to press you a little further on that final point. What role do you think that non-Welsh-speaking schools have in reaching this target?

[96] **Mr Jones:** I fynd nôl at y pwynt allweddol, mae'r Gymraeg yn perthyn i bawb. Beth bynnag yw'n cefndir ni, rydym yn digwydd bod yn byw yng Nghymru, ac mae angen i bawb deimlo balchder ein bod yn gallu siarad o leiaf dwy iaith—gobeithio,

Mr Jones: To return to the crucial point, the Welsh language belongs to all of us. Whatever our background, we live in Wales, and everyone should feel pride that we have at least two languages—hopefully, we could speak three, four or five languages—

tair, pedair neu bum iaith—oherwydd, yn y pen draw, mae'n gryfder allweddol i bob unigolyn os gallwn ni siarad a chyfathrebu mewn mwy nag un iaith.

because, ultimately, it is a strength for individuals to be able to communicate through the medium of more than one language.

[97] O safbwynt y rheini nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg, mae'n broses o annog a pherswadio, a dangos bod y Gymraeg nid yn unig yn sgîl i arwain at waith a chyflogaeth yn y pen draw, ond mae'n arwain at bod yn rhan o gymuned—yn rhan o gymuned ddwyieithog naturiol yng Nghymru. Drwy berthyn i gymuned, mae'n llawer haws cymhathu'r gymuned honno os ych chi'n digwydd bod yn gallu cyfrannu yn yr ieithoedd sy'n cael eu siarad yn y gymuned honno. Felly, mae'n broses o addysgu, ac mae'n broses o annog. Mae angen gwneud hynny mewn dulliau sensitif ond cadarn hefyd. I fynd nôl at strategaeth y Llywodraeth yn y pen draw—ac rydym ni'n dau yn llwyr gytûn bod y strategaeth honno'n symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir—mae angen dod â Chymru gyfan gyda ni i gefnogi'r strategaeth honno. Mae hynny'n digwydd ar lefel genedlaethol, ond mewn cymunedau hefyd lle mae'r Gymraeg yn fyw ac yn cael ei chlywed o ddydd i ddydd.

In terms of those who don't speak Welsh, then it is a process of encouragement and persuasion, and demonstrating that the Welsh language is not only a skill that can lead to opportunities in the workplace and can lead to employment, but that it leads to being part of a naturally bilingual community in Wales. By belonging to that community, it's far easier to assimilate into that community if you can contribute in the languages spoken in that community. So, it's a process of education and encouragement. That needs to be done in sensitive ways, but also it needs to be done robustly. If we return to the Government's strategy—and I think that we are both entirely agreed that that strategy is moving in the right direction—we do need to bring all of Wales with us on that journey to support the strategy. That happens at a national level, but also within communities where the Welsh language is a living language and is heard on a day-to-day basis.

[98] **Lee Waters:** Is it your understanding of the concept of moving along the continuum that all schools will, at some point, become Welsh-medium schools, and when do you think that might happen? How long do you think that would take?

[99] **Mr Jones:** Ni fyddaf yn bodoli, yn sicr. Ni fyddaf yn fyw bryd hynny, gan y bydd hi'n broses hir. Ond, yn y pen draw, dyna'r nod—hynny yw, pob ysgol yng Nghymru yn sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn gadael yn gwbl, gwbl hyddysg ac yn hyderus yn y Saesneg a'r Gymraeg, a bod yna falchder cenedlaethol mewn dwyieithrwydd. Dyna'r nod yn yr hir, hirdymor. Nid yw hynny'n mynd i ddigwydd dros nos. Bydd yn arwain at gryn dipyn o waith o ran adeiladu ar y sylfeini cadarn sydd eisoes wedi digwydd ers blynnyddoedd lawer mewn sawl rhan o Gymru. Mae angen y cysondeb hwnnw. Mae gwahanol ardaloedd yng Nghymru mewn mannau gwahanol ar hyd y daith, ac mae'n rhaid parchu hynny. Bydd ambell ardal yn gallu symud ymlaen yn gynt nag ambell ardal arall. Yn y pen draw, mae hyn yn dod yn ôl at strategaethau lleol yr awdurdodau addysg. Byddwch yn cwrdd â rhai o'r cynrychiolwyr hynny yn hwyrach heddiw. Rwy'n tybio bod rôl allweddol bwysig ganddyn nhw i gefnogi'r strategaeth.

Mr Jones: I won't be here at that time, certainly. It's going to be a very long process. But, ultimately, that's the aim—that every school in Wales ensures that every child in Wales leaves completely confident in English and Welsh, and that there is a national pride in bilingualism. That is the very long-term aim. That's not going to happen overnight. It's going to lead to quite a lot of work, building on the strong foundations that have already been laid in Wales. There is a need for that consistency. Different areas of Wales are in different places along this journey, and there is a need to respect that. Some areas will be able to move forward quicker than other areas. Ultimately, it comes back to the local strategies of the education authorities. You are meeting some of those representatives later today. I think they have a key role in supporting that strategy.

[100] **Bethan Jenkins:** Maen nhw wedi tynnu mas—

Bethan Jenkins: They have withdrawn, unfortunately—

[101] **Dai Lloyd:** Sydd yn bwynt arall.

Dai Lloyd: Which is another point.

[102] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sydd yn bwynt arall, yn hollol. Mae gan Suzy gwestiwn penodol ar y thema yma.

Bethan Jenkins: Which is another point altogether. Suzy has a specific question on this theme.

[103] **Suzy Davies:** Ie, ar y pwynt gwreiddiol: rydych chi'ch dau wedi sôn am gefnogaeth ac anogaeth i

Suzy Davies: Yes, on the original point: you have both mentioned support and encouragement for local

awdurdodau lleol. O ble y dylai hynny ddod? A ydym yn sôn am gonsortia neu'r Llywodraeth yn uniongyrchol? A yw'r capasiti yn y ddau yna yn barod i'ch helpu chi gyda'r nod yna? Ac a yw'r nod yn ymestyn hefyd i'r penaethiaid, neu dim ond yr awdurdodau lleol eu hunain?

authorities. Where should that come from? Are we talking about the consortia, or should it come directly from the Government? Is the capacity there in order to assist you in that aim? Also, does it extend to headteachers, or just to local authorities themselves?

[104] **Mr Tiplady:** Wel, fy hun, rwy'n teimlo bod hyn yn gorfod dod o'r Llywodraeth i ddechrau. Mae'n gorfod bod yn neges glir ynglŷn â'r datblygiad—ac hefyd helpu ardaloedd i ddatblygu a helpu ysgolion i ddatblygu. Fel y dywedodd Gwilym, mae gwahanol rhannau o Gymru mewn llefydd gwahanol. Byddai'n annheg disgwyl i ysgolion mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru ymateb fel y byddai ysgolion mewn ardaloedd traddodiadol Gymraeg. Felly, yn gyntaf, mae'n rhaid i hyn ddod o'r Llywodraeth, ac mae'n rhaid iddo ddod mewn modd cefnogol, adeiladol gyda rhyw fath o strwythur hirdymor ynglŷn â datblygiad. Rwy'n cytuno 100 y cant â Gwilym: dyna sy'n dod â phawb â'i gilydd, ac yn sicrhau bod pawb yn teimlo'n rhan o'r datblygiad, ac yn deall pam ei fod yn digwydd, pam ei fod yn bwysig, a pham ei fod o fudd i bawb—nid dim ond y bobl hynny yn yr ysgolion Cymraeg, ond beth gall y Gymraeg ei chynnig i bobl mewn ysgolion sydd ar hyn o bryd yn ysgolion uniaith Saesneg.

Mr Tiplady: Personally, I think it has to come from the Government, to start with. It has to be a clear message in terms of development—and also, helping areas to develop and helping schools to develop. As Gwilym said, there are different parts of Wales on different levels. It would be unfair to expect schools in some parts of Wales to respond in the same way as schools in more traditionally Welsh-speaking areas. So, first of all, it has to come from the Government, and it has to come in a supportive and constructive way, with some sort of long-term structure in terms of development. I agree 100 per cent with Gwilym: that's what brings people together and makes people feel part of that development, and that they understand why it is happening, why it is of benefit for everybody—not only those in Welsh-medium schools, but what the Welsh language can offer those people who are in English-medium schools at the moment.

[105] **Mr Jones:** Byddwn yn ategu hynny. Mae'n rhaid i'r cyfarwyddyd ddod o du'r Llywodraeth yn y

Mr Jones: I endorse that. The direction has to come from Government, ultimately. There is a

pendraw. Mae angen monitro bod y gweithredoedd yma'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad, a bod y polisi yn cael effaith gadarnhaol mewn siroedd penodol, ac yna ysgolion penodol, wrth i'r trafodaethau hyn ddigwydd. Dyna'r unig ffordd, hyd y gwelaf i. Ni wnaiff bethau ddim newid oni bai bod cyfarwyddyd pendant o du'r Llywodraeth.

need to monitor in order to ensure that these activities are happening on the ground, and that the policy is having a positive impact in specific counties, and then in specific schools, while these discussions are ongoing. That's the only way that things can change. Things won't change unless there is clear direction provided by Government.

[106] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy.

Bethan Jenkins: Jeremy.

[107] **Jeremy Miles:** Gwnaethom glywed yr wythnos diwethaf gan y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol eu bod nhw'n gweld, fel rhan o'u rôl nhw, y broses o normaleiddio'r Gymraeg, a bod y Gymraeg yn rhan o'r siwrnai addysg i fyd addysg uwch, fel rhan normal o fywyd. Y cwestiwn hwn o normaleiddio yw'r ail biler, os caf i ddefnyddio'r gair hwnnw, yn y strategaeth.

Jeremy Miles: What we heard last week from the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol was that it sees as part of its role the process of normalising the Welsh language, and that the Welsh language is part of the education journey to higher education, as a normal part of life. This question of normalisation is the second pillar, perhaps, if I can use that word, in the strategy.

10:00

[108] Hynny yw, mae addysg, ond hefyd y cwestiwn o wneud y Gymraeg yn iaith yr iard, iaith y gymuned ac iaith y stryd, ac ati. A ydych chi'n gweld, yn eich sefydliadau chi, rôl iddyn nhw yn y broses hynny—ynghyd ag addysgu pobl i ddysgu trwy'r Gymraeg—rôl i'w chwarae yn y broses honno o normaleiddio'r Gymraeg?

There is education, but also the question of making the Welsh language the language of the yard and the street, for example. Do you see in your institutions a role for them in that process—as well as teaching people to learn through the medium of Welsh—that there's also a role to play in that process of normalising the Welsh language?

[109] **Mr Tiplady:** Mae'r gwaith y mae'r coleg Cymraeg wedi ei wneud gyda ni fel sefydliad dros y

Mr Tiplady: The work that the coleg Cymraeg have done with us as an institution over the past few years

blynyddoedd diwethaf wedi bod yn wych. Mae wedi bod yn anhygoel, mae'n rhaid imi ddweud. Rydym ni wedi dyblu faint sy'n astudio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg gyda ni dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, o ganlyniad i'r gwaith y mae'r coleg Cymraeg wedi ei wneud. Mae'r continwwm ieithyddol yna'n un hollbwysig, ac wrth inni weithio fel sefydliad, a gweithio gyda'r coleg Cymraeg o ran ble rydym ni'n marchnata ein cyrsiau, mae pobl yn dweud trwy'r amser bod eisiau mynd yn ifancach ac ifancach. Mae dewisiadau ynglŷn â pha ysgol y mae pobl yn eu gwneud—ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd—yn aml yn cael eu gwneud achos beth maen nhw'n gweld y gallan nhw gyrraedd yn y diwedd: pa gyrsiau sydd ar gael trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a pha swyddi sydd ar gael.

[110] Un o'r pethau rydym ni'n ei weld nawr yw, er bod mathemateg, y gwyddorau a phethau fel hyn ar gael trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, mae o hyd y cysyniad yna'n bodoli nad ydych chi'n astudio'r gwyddorau yn y Gymraeg ac nad ydych chi'n gallu gwneud mathemateg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, er bod y cyfleon yna. Felly, mae dyletswydd arnom ni fel prifysgolion i wneud pobl yn fwy ymwybodol o'r continwwm ieithyddol yna sy'n parhau atom ni, ond hefyd cydweithio gyda'r Coleg Cymraeg er mwyn sicrhau bod y marchnata yna'n digwydd fel bod rhieni, wrth iddyn nhw wneud y penderfyniadau, neu ysgolion wrth iddyn nhw ddatblygu ar

has been wonderful. It's been incredible. We've doubled the numbers studying through the medium of Welsh over the past five years as a result of the work of the coleg Cymraeg. The linguistic continuum is crucially important and, as we work as an institution and work with the coleg Cymraeg in terms of where we market our courses, then people constantly tell us that we need to target at an earlier and earlier stage. The choices in terms of schools, in primary and in secondary, are often made in terms of what they believe they can achieve ultimately, what courses are available through the medium of Welsh and what jobs are available at the end of education.

One of the things that we see now is, although maths and sciences are available through the medium of Welsh, there's still that concept that you shouldn't study sciences through the medium of Welsh, or you shouldn't study maths through the medium of Welsh, although the opportunities are there. So we, as universities, are duty bound to make people more aware of the linguistic continuum that continues through to universities, but also in working with the Coleg Cymraeg in order to ensure that that marketing happens effectively, so that parents, as they make these choices, or the schools, as they develop along the journey, do

hyd y daith, yn sylwi bod yna gyfleoedd addysg uwch ar gael trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg sy'n mynd i arwain, wedyn, at swyddi ar ôl hynny.

understand that there are HE opportunities available through the medium of Welsh, which will then lead to jobs, ultimately.

[111] **Mr Jones:** Well i fi ddatgan diddordeb; rydw i'n un o gyfarwyddwyr y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol. Yn sicr, mae'r corff hwnnw wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth arwyddocaol iawn i'r Gymraeg o fewn addysg uwch yn ystod y cyfnod byr mae e wedi bodoli. O safbwynt normaleiddio'r Gymraeg, wedyn, o safbwynt ein sefydliad ni, yn sicr o weithio ar gampws Caerfyrddin, rydym ni ar fin sefydlu canolfan gwasanaethau Cymraeg a fydd yn cyflwyno modylau dewisol i holl fyfyrwyr y brifysgol ym maes y Gymraeg a'ch gyrfa a'r Gymraeg o fewn cyd-destun dwyieithog a'r gweithle dwyieithog. Hynny yw, bydd pob un o'n myfyrwyr ni yn cael cyfle cyn graddio i astudio un o'r modylau hynny, a fydd, gobeithio, yn codi eu hymwybyddiaeth nhw o'r gweithle dwyieithog ac yn sicrhau eu bod nhw'n gadael y brifysgol yn barod i weithio mewn cyd-destun lle mae yna fwy nag un iaith, boed yma yng Nghymru neu unrhyw fan arall yn y byd. Mae'r elfen honno yn bwysig iawn, iawn wrth eu paratoi nhw ar gyfer byd gwaith.

Mr Jones: I had better declare an interest here, because I am a director of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol. Certainly, that body has made a significant difference to the Welsh language within higher education during the very short time it's been in existence. In terms of normalising the Welsh language, in terms of our organisation and working on the Carmarthen campus, we are about to establish a Welsh language services centre that will introduce modules for all the students at the university in Welsh and your career and Welsh within a bilingual context and a bilingual workplace. All of our students, before graduating, will have an opportunity to study one of those modules, which will hopefully raise their awareness of the bilingual workplace and ensure that they leave university ready to work in a context where there is more than one language, whether that's in Wales or anywhere else in the world. That element is extremely important in preparing them for the world of work.

[112] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ni fydd hynny'n meddwl eu bod nhw'n dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond dysgu am, er enghraifft, sut i wneud CV neu sut i apelio am swydd sy'n gofyn am

Bethan Jenkins: That doesn't mean that they would learn through the medium of Welsh, but they would actually learn how to draw up a CV or how to apply for a job where the

y Gymraeg yn angenrheidiol, ac yn y blaen, ac yn y blaen—pethau felly, ie? Welsh language would be a requirement. Is that the case? That's the type of thing you're talking about, is it?

[113] **Mr Jones:** Yn union. Er enghraifft, ym maes twristiaeth, bydd yna nifer o Gymry di-Gymraeg ar y cwrs, ac rydym yn eu cyflwyno nhw i Gymraeg syml fydd yn cael ei defnyddio, dywedwch, o fewn cydestun twristiaeth, ond codi ymwybyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd cyfarch pobl, efallai, yn ddwyieithog pan ddôn nhw i Gymru ar eu gwyliau, ac yn y blaen. **Mr Jones:** Exactly. For example, in the field of tourism, there will be a number of non-Welsh-speakers on the course, and we introduce them to simple Welsh that could be used within the context of tourism, for example, but raising awareness of the importance of greeting people bilingually when they come to Wales on holiday, and so on.

[114] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes yna llefydd eraill sy'n gwneud hynny? A ydy Caerdydd Metropolitan yn gwneud yr un peth? **Bethan Jenkins:** And are there other places that do that? Does Cardiff Metropolitan do something similar?

[115] **Mr Tiplady:** Nid i'r un graddau ag y mae'r Drindod yn ei wneud. **Mr Tiplady:** Not to the same extent as Trinity Saint David, no.

[116] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sori? **Bethan Jenkins:** Sorry?

[117] **Mr Tiplady:** Nid i'r un graddau ag y mae'r Drindod yn ei wneud. **Mr Tiplady:** Not to the same extent as Trinity Saint David, no.

[118] **Bethan Jenkins:** Nid i'r un graddau. **Bethan Jenkins:** Not to the same extent.

[119] **Mr Tiplady:** Na. **Mr Tiplady:** No.

[120] **Mr Jones:** Ond rydym ni'n byw mewn cymuned ddwyieithog yn y de-orllewin, ac mae'n bwysig bod ein myfyrwyr ni—ac mae nifer sylweddol yn dod o sir Benfro ac o ardal Abertawe—yn mynd yn ôl i'w **Mr Jones:** We live in a bilingual community in south-west Wales and it's important that our students—a number come from Pembrokeshire and the Swansea area—go back to their communities, even if they

cymunedau nhw, er eu bod nhw perhaps don't speak Welsh, but they efallai yn ddi-Gymraeg, ond yn cael have some amount of ownership of rhywfaint o berchnogaeth o'u hiaith, the Welsh language, and can use it in o'r Gymraeg, mewn gwirionedd, ac their workplace, or at least be aware yn gallu ei defnyddio hi yn y of the importance of greeting gweithle, neu o leiaf bod yn somebody bilingually. That is as ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd cyfarch important, ultimately, as learning the rhywun yn ddwyieithog. Mae hynny yr language. un mor bwysig yn y pen draw, efallai, â dysgu'r iaith.

[121] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwy'n credu **Bethan Jenkins:** I think that takes us bod hynny'n ein symud ni ymlaen yn neatly on to Suzy's questions on naturiol at gwestiynau Suzy ar progression. ddilyniant.

[122] **Suzy Davies:** Okay. I want to ask about progression for actual pupils, first of all. Obviously, it's the aim of the Government to ensure that children leaving school leave with the same level of good Welsh, or good bilingual skills, regardless of their language background in the home. Bearing in mind the situation that not every part of Wales is starting from the same place, and bearing in mind that not every teacher will have the same level of Welsh language skills because of what we were discussing earlier, how realistic is that continuum aim?

[123] **Mr Tiplady:** Ydy, mae e'n un **Mr Tiplady:** Well, yes, it is heriol. Mae e'n rhywbeth rydym ni'n challenging. It is something that we ei wneud fel canolfan. Rydym ni'n as a centre do. We do assess the asesu'r gallu ieithyddol sydd gan ein linguistic abilities of our students as myfyrwyr wrth iddyn nhw gyrraedd, they arrive, and we provide support ac rydym yn cynnig cefnogaeth iddyn to them as they proceed through nhw wrth iddyn nhw fynd trwy'r their courses, in order to ensure—. cyrsiau, er mwyn sicrhau—. Eto, trwy Again, in working with the Coleg weithio gyda'r Coleg Cymraeg, os ych Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, if you are chi'n gwneud cymhwyster TAR, studying for a PGCE, you must have mae'n rhaid i chi wneud tystysgrif an additional qualification. I know cymhwysedd i athrawon nawr. Rwy'n that Trinity Saint David has this—all gwybod ei fod yn rhywbeth sydd gan centres have it now and we are all y Drindod—mae gan y canolfannau i part of the competency certificate for gyd nawr ac rŷm ni i gyd wedi dod yn teachers. Everyone was doing good rhan o'r dystysgrif cymhwysedd i work, but it was good work being

athrawon. Roedd pawb yn gwneud gwaith da ond gwaith da ar wahân, felly mae wedi trial dod â phethau at ei gilydd a thrial wedyn cysoni'r ffaith bod pawb yn gorfod cyrraedd lefel y cymhwyster erbyn diwedd eu cwrs nhw—ond mae'n rhywbeth heriol.

done in isolation, so we've tried to bring it all together and provide some consistency that everyone should reach the level of competence by the end of their course—but as you say, it's challenging.

[124] **Mr Jones:** Os caf i gyfeirio at strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg y Llywodraeth, yr un a gyhoeddwyd yn 2010, mae'n nodi mai

Mr Jones: If I could just refer to the Welsh Government's Welsh-medium education strategy that was published in 2010, it notes that

[125] 'Addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg o'r blynyddoedd cynnar, gyda dilyniant ieithyddol cadarn drwy bob cyfnod addysg, sy'n cynnig yr amodau gorau ar gyfer meithrin pobl ifanc sy'n wirioneddol ddwyieithog.'

'Welsh-medium education from the early years, with robust linguistic progression through every phase of education, offers the best conditions for developing young people who are truly bilingual.'

[126] Dyna ddatganiad clir y Llywodraeth yn ôl yn 2010. Er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd, rŷm ni'n mynd yn ôl eto at sicrhau bod y gweithlu o'r blynyddoedd cynnar—

So, that is a clear statement from the Government back in 2010. In order to ensure that that happens, we go back again to ensure that the workforce from the early years—

[127] **Suzy Davies:** Roeddwn i'n mynd i ddod at hynny.

Suzy Davies: Yes, I was going to come to that.

[128] **Mr Jones:** —athrawon cynradd, athrawon uwchradd, tiwtoriaid Cymraeg i oedolion ac yn y blaen—bod yna barhad felly yn y ddarpariaeth. Nid oes neb wedi sôn am y gair 'ansawdd' heddiw. Rwy'n meddwl bod ansawdd y ddarpariaeth, yn amlwg, yr un mor bwysig â'i hehangder hi. Felly, mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau nid yn unig gyflenwad o athrawon a chynorthwyrwyr dysgu a gweithwyr blynyddoedd cynnar, ond

Mr Jones:—primary school teachers, secondary school teachers, Welsh language tutors for adults—that there is a continuum therefore in the provision. Nobody has mentioned the word 'quality' today and I think the quality of the provision is clearly as important as its breadth. We need to ensure not only the supply of teachers and teaching assistants and early years workers—we need to ensure the quality, those who can

rhai o ansawdd sy'n gallu cyflwyno ac annog ac ysbrydoli'r bobl ifanc yma mewn ffordd arbennig iawn. Felly, mae angen i'r strategaeth newydd hon roi sylw dyledus i'r continwwm hwnnw, nid yn unig o ran profiad y disgybl, felly, ond y sawl sydd yn cyflwyno'r Gymraeg hefyd.

encourage and inspire these young people in a very special way. So, there is a need for this new strategy to give attention to that continuum, not only from the experience of the pupil but also those who are presenting the Welsh language.

[129] Af i yn ôl eto at un o'r pwyntiau blaenorol y gwnes i os caf i, Gadeirydd, sef y pwysigrwydd yma o geisio cael rhagor o bobl ifanc i astudio'r Gymraeg o ran safon uwch. Mae'r niferoedd yn bryderus o isel ar hyn o bryd os ydym ni am gael dylanwad mewn 10, 15, 20 mlynedd, ac mae hwnnw'n fater y byddwn i'n gofyn i chi rhoi sylw ar fyrder iddo fe.

I'll go back to one of the previous points I made, Chair, which was the importance of trying to get more of our young people to study Welsh at A-level. The numbers are very low and that's a concern at the moment if we're going to have an influence in 10, 15, 20 years, and that would be an issue that I would ask you to look into with urgency.

[130] **Suzy Davies:** Wel, rwyf wedi pwyntio at ansawdd mewn ffordd achos—y tu ôl i fy nghwestiwn yw: beth fyddai'r effaith ar blant di-Gymraeg, ar eu continwwm, gan athrawon sydd ddim yn hyderus yn yr iaith sydd â chyfrifoldeb i'w dysgu nhw drwy'r Gymraeg?

Suzy Davies: I have referred to quality in a way, because what was behind my question was what would the impact be on non-Welsh-speaking children, and on their continuum, if they were taught by teachers who weren't confident in the language but were responsible for tutoring them in the language?

[131] **Mr Jones:** Beth bynnag yw'r iaith, rŷch chi eisiau athro sydd yn gallu ysbrydoli'r plant hyn. Yn y fan honno y byddwn i'n cychwyn ac yn gorffen a dweud y gwir, oherwydd beth bynnag yw'r iaith, rŷch chi eisiau sicrhau bod pob un athro, gan gynnwys, os caf i ddweud, athrawon cyflenwi—achos pan fo athro neu athrawes yn gadael y dosbarth, rŷch chi yn disgwyl bod y person sy'n dod

Mr Jones: Whatever the language, you want a teacher that's going to inspire the children, and that's where I would start and finish. Whatever the language, you want to ensure that every teacher, including supply teachers, if I may say that—when a teacher leaves the classroom you do expect that the teacher coming in his or her place will be as good or even better than that teacher. I think that

i mewn yn ei le fe neu ei lle hi gystal os nad gwell. Felly, mae hwnnw'n fater sydd eto, rwy'n siŵr, yn rhoi pryder i rai awdurdodau lleol.

is a matter of concern for some local authorities.

[132] **Suzy Davies:** Mae'n her ychwanegol ac efallai y gallwn ni ystyried hyn rywbryd arall. A allaf i jest fynd yn ôl hefyd—? Rŷch chi wedi sôn am hynny yn barod—y blynyddoedd cynnar, y gweithlu ar ôl ysgol, ar ôl coleg a phob peth. Sut y mae pob sector yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd ar hyn o bryd gyda'r camau cyntaf tuag at nod y Llywodraeth?

Suzy Davies: That's an additional challenge that we should consider at another time perhaps. If I could return to something that you've already mentioned—early years through to the workplace after school or college. How are the sectors working together at the moment with those first steps towards achieving the Government's objectives?

[133] **Mr Jones:** Mae'n rhaid imi ddatgan yn syth nad ydw i'n arbenigo yn y maes hwnnw o gwbl. Dyna i gyd y gallaf ei ddweud: o safbwynt y brifysgol, rŷm ni yn gweithio gyda'r asiantaethau priodol i achredu'n rhaglenni plentyndod cynnar ni. Mae yna raglen sydd ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg ac yn ddwyieithog, felly rŷm ni'n cynnig tri llwybr penodol i'n dysgwyr ni. Yn amlwg, gyda'r mwyafrif yn dod o ranbarth de-orllewin Cymru, maen nhw'n ffitio yn dda i'r tair adran hynny. Ond, i'r rheini sy'n astudio yn Gymraeg, yn ddwyieithog neu drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg, maen nhw'n cael eu paratoi yn drylwyr ar gyfer cyddestun dwyieithog—hyd yn oed y rheini sydd ddim yn siarad Cymraeg, maen nhw'n cael eu cyflwyno i'r Gymraeg a sut mae cyflwyno'r Gymraeg i'r plant lleiaf. Felly, rŷm ni'n hapus ein bod ni'n diwallu'r anghenion. Rŷm ni'n cydweithio â'r

Mr Jones: Well, I should state immediately that I'm no expert in that area. All I can say: in terms of the university, we are working with the appropriate agencies to accredit our early years programmes. There is a programme available through the medium of Welsh, another through the medium of English and there is one that is bilingual, so there are three learning routes for our students. With the majority coming from the south-west of Wales, they fit neatly into those three categories. But for those studying through the medium of Welsh, bilingually or through the medium of English, they are thoroughly prepared for a bilingual context. Even those who don't speak Welsh, they are introduced to the Welsh language and how to present the Welsh language to those youngest children. So, we are content that we are meeting the needs. We are working

asiantaethau priodol. Mae nifer o'n myfyrwyr yn mynd ymlaen i sefydlu canolfannau gofal plant, nifer wedi mynd ymlaen i reoli canolfannau gofal plant yn Gymraeg ac yn ddwyieithog. Mae gennym ni yn y brifysgol feithrinfa, y Gamfa Wen, sydd yn feithrinfa yn canolbwyntio ar y Gymraeg. Felly, mae'n myfyrwyr ni'n cael hyfforddiant mewn cydestun cwbl, cwbl ddwyieithog, felly maen nhw'n cael eu paratoi yn drylwyr. Ond o safbwynt cydweithio ymhellach, nid ydw i mewn sefyllfa i ateb eich cwestiwn chi, yn anffodus.

[134] **Mr Tiplady:** Na finnau, mae'n flin gen i. Dim ond ategu—mae ein hastudiaethau plentyndod cynnar ni yn yr un sefyllfa. Rŷm ni'n gweithio'n agos gyda darparwyr lleol ac yn sicrhau bod dwyieithrwydd yn elfen gref o'r cyrsiau i gyd.

[135] **Suzy Davies:** A allaf i ofyn am hynny, te? Achos mae pobl sy'n mynd i goleg, yn arbennig i astudio gofal plant, er enghraifft, yn dod o'r ardal leol yn aml. Nid yw'r un peth gyda'r prifysgolion. Felly, os yw'r coleg mewn lle di-Gymraeg, pa fath o Gymraeg rŷch chi'n ei weld ar y cyrsiau gofal plant, er enghraifft? Achos mae yna gyfrifoldeb arnoch chi, mewn ffordd, i fod yn siŵr bod gan yr athrawon sy'n dysgu'r cyrsiau yna lefel o Gymraeg, os maen nhw'n mynd i'w cyflawni.

[136] **Mr Jones:** O safbwynt y radd BA addysg plentyndod cynnar yn y

with the appropriate agencies. Many of our students go on to establish childcare centres, many have gone on to manage childcare centres through the medium of Welsh and bilingually. At the university, we have a nursery, y Gamfa Wen, which focuses on the Welsh language. Therefore, our students are trained in an entirely bilingual context, so they are thoroughly prepared. But in terms of further collaboration, I'm not in a position to answer your question, I'm afraid.

Mr Tiplady: Neither am I, I'm afraid. Our early years studies are in the same position. We work with local providers and do ensure that bilingualism is a strong element of all of those courses.

Suzy Davies: Can I ask about that, then? People who go to college, particularly to study childcare, are from the local area quite often. That's not true with universities, perhaps. But, if a college is in a non-Welsh-speaking area, what sort of Welsh do you find on childcare courses, for example? Because there is a responsibility on you, really, to ensure that the teachers who teach on those courses have a level of Welsh, if they are to deliver.

Mr Jones: In terms of the early years education BA course at Trinity Saint

Drindod, mae'r cwrs hwn yn rhedeg ers degawd a rhagor. Rydym ni wastad wedi cael llwybr cyfrwng Cymraeg. Byddwn i'n dadlau yn reit gryf fod canran uchel o'r myfyrwyr hynny yn fyfyrwyr aeddfed—gwragedd, yn benodol, sydd wedi cael plant, ac yn dod nôl i addysg. Rydym ni fel sefydliad wedi penderfynu darparu dau lwybr iddyn nhw: y llwybr traddodiadol, lle maen nhw'n dod i mewn bob dydd yn ystod yr wythnos waith, ond llwybr dysgu hyblyg hefyd, lle maen nhw'n dod i mewn gyda'r nos ac ar benwythnosau, lle mae staff yr ysgol plentyndod cynnar yn rhoi o'u hamser i fod ar gael ar benwythnosau a gyda'r nos i gefnogi'r myfyrwyr aeddfed yma sy'n parhau i weithio. Yn aml iawn, dyna'r myfyrwyr cryfaf, yn y pen draw, sef myfyrwyr sy'n dod o'r gweithle. Rydw i'n edmygu'n fawr iawn eu hymrwymiad nhw a'u parodrwydd nhw i ddatblygu law yn llaw â gweithio o ddydd i ddydd. Mae'n dipyn o ymrwymiad. Felly, i ateb eich cwestiwn chi, rydw i'n hyderus fod canran uchel iawn o'r myfyrwyr hynny yn fyfyrwyr safonol iawn, a nifer ohonyn nhw sy'n mynd nôl i'r gweithle a chael dyrchafiad wedyn yn sgil y ffaith eu bod nhw wedi cael cymhwyster gradd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu yn ddwyieithog.

David, that's been going for a decade and more. We've always had a Welsh-medium pathway through that course, and I would make the case quite strongly that a high percentage of those students are mature students—mainly women who've had children and are returning to education. We as an institution have decided to provide two pathways: the traditional pathway, where they come in every day during the working week, but also a flexible learning pathway, where they come in in the evenings and on weekends. So, the staff of the early years school do provide their time to be available in the evenings and at weekends to support these mature students who continue to work. Very often, they are the strongest students, namely those who come directly from the workplace. I very much admire their commitment and their willingness to develop themselves along with working on a day-to-day basis. It's quite a commitment for them. So, to answer your question, I am confident that a very high percentage of those students are of a high quality, and many of them will return to the workplace and gain promotion as a result of the fact that they have achieved graduate level through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.

[137] **Suzy Davies:** Felly, maen nhw'n chwilio am y Gymraeg—pobl fel hynny—yn lle meddwl, 'O, Cymraeg unwaith eto', fel y mae rhai

Suzy Davies: Therefore, they're looking for the Welsh language—people like that—instead of thinking, 'Oh, Welsh once again', as some,

sy'n dod yn syth o'r ysgol weithiau yn ei feddwl. who've come straight out of school, sometimes think.

[138] **Mr Jones:** Mae'r rheini sydd o ddifrif eisiau aros yn yr ardal, yn ne-orllewin Cymru, yn gweld budd sylweddol o astudio o leiaf rhan o'u cwrs trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. **Mr Jones:** Those who are serious about staying in the region, in the south-west of Wales, see great benefit in studying at least part of their course through the medium of Welsh.

[139] **Suzy Davies:** O, grêt. Diolch. **Suzy Davies:** Oh, great. Thank you.

[140] **Mr Tiplady:** Rydym ni'n cynnig llwybr Cymraeg a llwybr Saesneg hefyd. Mae'r niferoedd yn eithaf da ar y llwybr Cymraeg, ac yn fwy sylweddol ar yr un Saesneg. Ond mae'r rheini gyda ni, yn wahanol i'r rheini gyda Gwilym, yn rhai traddodiadol—yn aml yn syth o'r ysgolion, ac, yn aml, efallai, gyda'r syniad o fynd mewn i ofal plant, neu o bosibl yn gweld hyn fel llwybr i mewn i ddysgu ac wedyn y dilyniant i'r cyrsiau uwch TAR sydd gyda ni. **Mr Tiplady:** We offer a Welsh route and an English path as well. There are good numbers on the Welsh-language one, and a more substantial number on the English side. But those we have, different from Gwilym, are traditional ones—usually straight from school, and usually perhaps with the idea of going into childcare or seeing this as a pathway into teaching and then progression to the higher PGCE courses that we have.

[141] **Suzy Davies:** Ocê. Diolch. **Suzy Davies:** Okay. Thank you.

[142] **Bethan Jenkins:** Lee.

[143] **Lee Waters:** Just to pick up on that issue of the different catchments that you both appeal to, you said earlier, Mr Jones, that the view of your institution was that there should be a compulsory element in all teacher training courses across Wales for a Welsh-language element. Clearly, many of the students that you're all appealing to have options: they don't have to stay in Wales; they could go elsewhere. So, what assessment have you made about the likely consequence of having that element of compulsion on the levels of recruitment we might have for teachers in Wales?

[144] **Mr Jones:** O safbwynt y cyrsiau cynradd, nid ydym ni wedi dod ar **Mr Jones:** From the point of view of primary courses, we haven't come

draws unrhyw anawsterau recriwtio sylweddol iawn. Rwy'n meddwl ein bod ni'n trosglwyddo'r Gymraeg i'r rheini sy'n dysgu'r Gymraeg fel ffordd o'u paratoi nhw ar gyfer unrhyw gyd-destun dysgu. Rydym ni wedi cael llythyron gan fyfyrwyr sydd wedi mynd i weithio yn Llundain a de Lloegr, sydd wedi cael eu hunain mewn sefyllfa lle maen nhw'n dysgu mewn ysgol lle mae dwy neu dair iaith yn cael eu dysgu. Felly, rydych chi'n eu paratoi nhw ar gyfer dysgu mewn cyd-destun dwyieithog neu amlieithog. Ond rwy'n meddwl ei fod yn bwysig, os ydyn nhw'n dod i un o'r sefydliadau neu un o'r canolfannau yng Nghymru, eu bod nhw'n sylweddoli bod yr addysg a chawson nhw yn fanna yn wahanol i'r hyn a chawson nhw yn Lloegr, neu yn yr Alban, neu yn Iwerddon neu ble bynnag—ei fod yn addysg Gymreig a'u bod nhw'n cael eu paratoi ar gyfer cyd-destun gwlad lle mae yna ddwy iaith swyddogol a lle mae yna alw am addysg drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg a thrwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac, yn wir, addysg ddwyieithog hefyd. Felly, er mwyn paratoi unrhyw un sy'n graddio o'r canolfannau achrededig hyn, rydw i'n meddwl bod dyletswydd arnom ni i sicrhau bod pob un sydd yn graddio yn gadael gydag elfen o ddealltwriaeth bod Cymru yn wlad ddwyieithog a bod angen cyflwyno dwy iaith mewn ysgol.

across any significant recruitment difficulties. I think we are transferring the Welsh language to those who are learning Welsh as a way of preparing them for any teaching context. We've received letters from students who've gone to work in London and the south of England who find themselves in a situation where there are two or three languages are used. So, you are preparing them for teaching in a bilingual or multilingual context. But I do think it's important that, if they come to one of the institutions or centres in Wales, they understand that the education that they will get there is different from that they will get in Scotland, England or Ireland or wherever—that it is a Welsh education and that they are being prepared for the context of a nation where there are two official languages and where there is demand for education through the medium of English and through the medium of Welsh, as well as bilingual education. So, in order to prepare anyone who graduates from these accredited centres, I think that we are duty bound to ensure that every one of our students leaves with an element of understanding that Wales is a bilingual nation, and that we need to present two languages in school.

[145] **Lee Waters:** I understand that, but my question is slightly different. It's about the unintended consequence of that on the numbers and the

standards of the graduates and the undergraduates who we might attract. Has there been any assessment of the likely impact of that?

10:15

[146] **Mr Jones:** Nid wyf yn meddwl fod unrhyw asesiad ffurfiol wedi digwydd o hynny, nag oes—dim hyd y gwn i. **Mr Jones:** I don't think there's been any formal assessment, no—not as far as I know.

[147] **Lee Waters:** Don't you think we need that before we start making proposals of this nature?

[148] **Mr Jones:** Mae'n gwestiwn pwysig, ydy. Mae angen ystyried, yn amlwg, yr holl oblygiadau, nid dim ond y pwynt rŷch chi'n ei wneud o safbwynt y niferoedd sydd angen eu hyfforddi yng Nghymru. Mae'n dibynnu hefyd faint mae'r boblogaeth yn mynd i gynyddu neu leihau. Mae sawl ffactor. Nid wyf yn siŵr os wy'n deall eich cwestiwn, mae'n ddrwg gen i. A hoffech chi—? **Mr Jones:** It's an important question, yes. We do, of course, need to consider all the implications, not only the points that you have made in terms of the numbers that we need to train in Wales. It depends also on what changes there will be in demographics. There are several factors. I'm not sure if I understood your question entirely. Would you like to—?

[149] **Mr Tiplady:** O'm rhan i, mae 85 y cant o'n myfyrwyr ni yn dod o Gymru yn barod. Felly, mae 15 y cant yn dod o ar draws y ffin. Mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau ein bod yn paratoi 100 y cant o'r myfyrwyr yna i weithio yng Nghymru, o bosib. Ond y cwestiwn sydd gyda chi yw, wrth gynyddu hynny, a ydy hynny'n mynd i leihau'r niferoedd hynny sy'n dod o ar draws y ffin? Wel, nid ydym ni'n gwybod, yw'r ateb i hynny. Ond mae yna ddyletswydd arnom ni i baratoi pawb—y 100 y cant o'r rheini—at y posibilrwydd ar ôl iddyn nhw orffen y byddan nhw'n gweithio yng Nghymru **Mr Tiplady:** From my point of view, 85 per cent of our students are Welsh domiciled. So, 15 per cent cross the border, as it were. We must ensure that we prepare 100 per cent of those students to work in Wales, possibly. But the question that you have is whether increasing that is going to reduce the numbers that come across the border. Well, we simply don't know, that's the answer to that. But we are duty-bound to prepare everyone—100 per cent of our students—for the possibility that they will work in Wales.

ac y byddan nhw yma.

[150] **Beth rŷm ni'n ffyddiog iawn** What we are very confident of and
 amdano a beth rŷm ni'n ei wneud yw, what we do is that, when we do bring
 pan fyddwn ni yn dod â Chymraeg incidental Welsh in, we do it at the
 achlysurol i mewn, rydym ni'n level it is at the moment, do it well,
 gwneud hynny ar y lefel y mae ar hyn and ensure that the students
 o bryd, yn dda, ac yn gwneud i'r understand why we're presenting
 myfyrwyr ddeall pam fyddwn ni'n that to them and give them that
 wneud e a rhoi'r cyd-destun Cymreig Welsh context. So, my understanding
 iddyn nhw. Felly, o'r ddealltwriaeth is that the students, even those who
 sydd gen i, mae'r myfyrwyr, hyd yn study through the medium of
 oed y rhai sy'n astudio trwy gyfrwng English, are happy with the level of
 y Saesneg, yn hapus i wneud y lefel o Welsh presented at the moment
 Gymraeg y maen nhw'n ei wneud yn because they understand the Welsh
 awr achos maen nhw'n deall y cyd- context. But there's been no further
 destun Cymreig. Ond nid oes asesiad assessment of whether increasing
 pellach wedi'i wneud o ran, wrth that would have an impact on the
 gynyddu hynny, na fyddai hynny'n numbers crossing the border.
 denu mwy o ar draws y ffin.

[151] **Lee Waters:** Exactly. That's my concern, Mr Jones: the impact it has
 overall on the numbers and standards of the students we attract. I just
 wondered if, behind your recommendation, there was any work done on
 assessing that, but it seems not; it's more of a value-based judgment.

[152] **Mr Jones:** Nid wyf yn rhagweld **Mr Jones:** I don't foresee that there
 y byddai yna effaith negyddol ar y would be a negative impact on
 recriwtio oherwydd, yn y pen draw, recruitment because, ultimately, it's a
 canran fechan iawn, iawn o'r very, very small percentage of
 myfyrwyr sy'n dod o Loegr i'r cyrsiau students who come from England to
 hyfforddi athrawon—yn gyffredinol, the teacher training courses—in
 canran fechan, fechan iawn. general, it's a very, very small
 percentage.

[153] **Lee Waters:** Okay. I have a final question about the level of joined-up
 action between central and local government on the strategies and the
 funding. What's your experience of how co-ordinated and integrated the
 different levels of government are in this sector, in this area?

[154] **Mr Tiplady:** Nid oes gormod o **Mr Tiplady:** I don't have too much

brofiad gennyf i ynglŷn â hynny, experience in that field, I have to say.
mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud. Gwilym, a Gwilym, do you have anything to say?
oes rhywbeth gyda chi?

[155] **Mr Jones:** Nac oes. Hynny yw— **Mr Jones:** No. That is—are you talking
a ydych chi'n sôn am y cyngor about the funding council?
cyllido?

[156] **Lee Waters:** I mean generally, in terms of teacher training. Are the
centre and the local authorities sufficiently integrated in pushing in the same
direction to reach the targets that we want to meet?

[157] **Mr Jones:** I ateb y cwestiwn ar **Mr Jones:** To answer your question
ei ben, rwy'n meddwl bod modd i'r directly, I think that central
Llywodraeth ganolog, awdurdodau Government, local authorities, the
lleol, y consortiwm lleol a'r ganolfan local consortia and the local training
hyfforddi leol gydweithio'n agosach centres could collaborate more
ar adegau. Barn bersonol yw hynny closely at times. That's a personal
yn fwy na barn sefydliadol. Weithiau, opinion rather than an institutional
rydym ni'n colli cyfle, efallai, i rannu opinion. But, on occasion, we may be
adnoddau ac i sicrhau'r continwwm missing some opportunities to share
hwnnw o'r hyfforddiant cychwynnol, resources and to secure that
hyfforddiant parhaus a datblygiad continuum from the initial training,
proffesiynol parhaus athrawon o through to CPD and general training
fewn rhanbarth. Hynny yw, mae yna for teachers. That is, there's been
welliant mawr wedi digwydd, ond great improvement, but I do think
rwy'n meddwl bod lle i gydweithio'n that there is room for closer
llawer agosach eto. collaboration, certainly.

[158] **Lee Waters:** Grêt, diolch. **Lee Waters:** Great, thanks.

[159] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much
iawn i chi am ddod—. O, mae gan for coming—. Oh, Suzy has a quick
Suzy gwestiwn clou. question.

[160] **Suzy Davies:** It's sort of on the same point. A continuum for teachers
and children, we've all been talking about that, but, in the future, we are still
likely to be attracting and needing teachers, particularly at secondary-school
level, who haven't trained in Wales and don't come from Wales. Are we
confident that we can help those teachers reach skill levels that are useful?

[161] **Mr Jones:** O safbwynt safonau, mi ddylai fod yna gysondeb ar draws Cymru a Lloegr—i fynd nôl at eich pwynt chi yn awr—hynny yw, mae'n rhaid cyrraedd safon benodol cyn derbyn statws athro cymwysedig. Yr hyn yr hoffwn ei weld, i'r rheini sy'n cael eu hyfforddi yn Lloegr ac yn dymuno dod yn ôl i Gymru, yw bod yna gwrs diweddarau neu gwrs uwchraddio neu uwchsgilio o ran Cymreictod, i'w paratoi nhw i weithio yng Nghymru. Oherwydd mae gweithio yng Nghymru rywfaint yn wahanol i weithio mewn dinas neu ardal wledig yn Lloegr. Felly, mae angen rhyw hyfforddiant, boed yn becyn dysgu o bell neu beth bynnag—bod rhywbeth ar gael i'w hatgoffa nhw fod y cyd-destun Cymreig yn wahanol i'r cyd-destun y tu draw i'r ffin.

Mr Jones: In terms of standards, there should be consistency across Wales and England—to go back to your point now—that is, there is a need to reach a specific standard before getting the qualification of a teacher. What I would like to see, for those who have trained in England and wish to come back to Wales, is that there is an updating course or an upskilling course available in terms of Welshness, which prepares them to work in Wales. Because working in Wales is slightly different to working in a city or a rural area in England. So, there is a need for some sort of training, whether it is a distance-learning package or whatever—that something is available to remind them that the Welsh context is different to the context across the border.

[162] **Suzy Davies:** Okay, so it's more about learning the context of teaching in Wales, rather than becoming skilled enough in the Welsh language to be able to teach.

[163] **Mr Jones:** Eto, fe fyddwn i'n gobeithio, fel rhan o'r pecyn hwnnw, fod pecyn gloywi iaith ar gael.

Mr Jones: Again, I would hope that, as part of that package, there would be a Welsh improvement package as well.

[164] **Suzy Davies:** Yes, because some will come in and go back to England at some point, so they're not staying forever. Okay, thanks. Diolch.

[165] **Bethan Jenkins:** Grêt. Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi am ddod mewn heddiw. Mae'n siŵr y byddwch chi'n dilyn yr hyn rydym ni yn ei wneud fel ymchwiliad, a bydd croeso i chi edrych ar y record i sicrhau eich bod

Bethan Jenkins: Excellent. Thank you very much for joining us today. I am sure you will be following our inquiry, and you're welcome to review the record to ensure that you are happy with everything. You can't

yn hapus gyda phopeth. Ni fyddwch yn gallu ei newid, wrth gwrs, ond—. [Chwerthin.] Diolch yn fawr iawn am ddod mewn heddiw.

10:20

Papurau i'w Nodi **Papers to Note**

[166] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwyf am symud yn glou i'r eitem, papurau i'w nodi, fel ein bod ni wedi ei wneud. Papur 1 yw llythyr ataf i gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cabinet dros yr Economi a Seilwaith ynglŷn â Chymru Hanesyddol, a phapur 2 yw llythyr ataf i gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg am ymchwiliad i strategaeth y Gymraeg newydd Llywodraeth Cymru. A yw pawb yn hapus i nodi'r llythyrau hynny? Fe wnawn ni gael seibiant nes bod y tystion eraill yn dod. Diolch yn fawr.

Bethan Jenkins: I want to move swiftly to the papers to note so that we've covered that. The first paper is a letter to me from the Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure on Historic Wales, and the second is a letter from the Chair of the Children, Young People and Education Committee on the inquiry into the Welsh Government's new Welsh language strategy. Is everyone content to note those pieces of correspondence? We will have a break until our next witnesses arrive. Thank you.

Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:21 a 10:36
The meeting adjourned between 10:21 and 10:36.

Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth y Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru: **Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 5** **Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:** **Evidence Session 5**

[167] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. Rŷm ni'n parhau â'r gwaith ynglŷn â 1 filiwn o siaradwyr fel rhan o'r dystiolaeth. Diolch yn fawr i Hayden Llewellyn, prif weithredwr Cyngor y Gweithlu Addysg, ac i Angela Jardine,

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. We continue with the work on the 1 million Welsh speakers as part of the evidence. Thank you very much to Hayden Llewellyn, chief executive of the Education Workforce

sef cadeirydd Cyngor y Gweithlu Addysg, am ddod i mewn atom ni heddiw—croeso i chi. Rŷm ni am gychwyn gyda chwestiynau, os ys hynny'n iawn gyda chi. Mae gennym nifer o gwestiynau ar nifer o sectorau. Roeddwn i jest eisiau gofyn cwestiwn clou i ddechrau: beth yw eich barn gynhenid chi ynglŷn ag a yw'r amcan yma o gael 1 filiwn o siaradwyr erbyn 2050 yn rhywbeth rŷch chi'n ei gefnogi? A ydy e'n realistig ac ymarferol? Pa fath o newidiadau a fydd angen cael eu gwneud er mwyn sicrhau bod y gôl hynny'n cael ei gwireddu? Rwyf i jest eisiau cael eich barn gyntaf ynglŷn â hyn. Diolch yn fawr.

[168] **Ms Jardine:** Diolch yn fawr. Fe wnaif i ddechrau. Diolch yn fawr am y gwahoddiad, beth bynnag, i ddechrau. Rŷm ni'n meddwl ei fod yn beth da bod y drafodaeth hon yn mynd yn ei blaen ac rŷm ni'n gweld bod y targed yn ei hunain yn heriol tu hwnt, ond rŷm ni'n meddwl bod modd i fod yn llwyddiannus efo hyn cyn belled â bod yna strwythur a chynllun yn eu lle a bod digon o amser—ac rŷm ni'n meddwl bod digon o amser—i wneud yn siŵr bod y cynllun yn dod yn fyw fel y disgwylir.

[169] Rŷm ni meddwl bod rhaid trio diffinio beth ydy ystyr siaradwr Cymraeg er mwyn medru asesu llwyddiant y project, ond mae eisiau gwneud bach mwy o waith i egluro ystyr y term yna cyn dechrau.

Council, and Angela Jardine, who is the chair of the Education Workforce Council, for coming in today—welcome to you. We want to start with questions, if that's okay with you. We have a number of questions on a number of different areas. I just want to ask a quick question to begin in the context of your view on whether this stated aim of reaching 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050 is something that you support. Is it realistic and practical? What sort of changes would be required to ensure that that aim is realised? I just want to have your initial view on this. Thank you.

Ms Jardine: Thank you very much. I'll start. Thank you for the invitation to appear before you. We believe that it is positive that this debate is happening and we see the target as being exceptionally challenging, but we do believe that it is achievable as long as there are structures and plans in place and that there is sufficient time—and we believe that there is—to ensure that this aim is achieved as expected.

We do believe that we should endeavour to define the meaning of Welsh speaker, so that we can benchmark the success of the project, but some more work needs to be done to actually explain that

term before we start.

[170] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydych chi wedi edrych ar beth yw'ch diffiniad chi o gwbl?

Bethan Jenkins: Have you given any thought to your idea of the meaning of that term?

[171] **Ms Jardine:** Wel, na, achos mae yna wahanol ffyrdd o'i wneud. Rŷm ni jest yn meddwl bod rhaid cael eglurhad ynglŷn â hynny. Nid ydym eisiau dweud beth ddylai hynny fod, ond rŷm ni'n gweld, gyda phethau fel Donaldson er enghraifft, ei bod yn bwysig ei bod yn iaith fyw sy'n cael ei defnyddio yn y gymuned yn ogystal ag yn yr ysgolion—nid jest yn yr ysgolion.

Ms Jardine: Well, no, because there are different ways of doing that. We just think there is a need for an explanation on that. We don't want to say what that should be, but we see, for example in Donaldson, that it's important that's it's a language that's alive and used in communities as well as in schools—not just in schools.

[172] Do you want to add anything?

[173] **Mr Llewellyn:** Yes. I would add to what Angela says there and just call for us to be realistic. The 2011 census indicated just over 500,000 Welsh speakers, so we're looking to double that number. As Angela indicated there, we're reassured by the timescale—it is a realistic timescale—but it's still a really big increase. So, I think the starting point absolutely has to be that we know what we're counting and everybody in Wales is clear that if we do or don't meet the target, we're absolutely clear what we're measuring against. That absolutely has to be our starting point.

[174] **Ms Jardine:** Rŷm ni hefyd yn gallu dweud ychydig bach estra am y gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud yn barod. O'n cofrestr ni, rŷm ni'n gwybod bod yna *sabbaticals* wedi bod yn cael eu gwneud ers tipyn nawr, ond yn ôl beth sydd gennym ni ar ein cofrestr, mae impact hynny'n gymharol fach, o gofio'r ynni sydd wedi mynd i mewn i wneud y mathau yna o raglenni. So, mae eisiau edrych yn fanwl ar le rŷm ni'n dechrau efo'r gweithlu addysg,

Ms Jardine: We can also say a little bit about the work that has been done already. From our register, we know that sabbaticals have been ongoing for a while now, but according to what we've got on our register, the impact of that is comparatively small, given the energy that has gone into doing those sorts of programmes. So, there is a need to look in detail at where we start with the education workforce, because we're of the

achos rŷm ni o'r farn y bydd y opinion that the education workforce gweithlu addysg yn allweddol iawn i will be very key to the success of this lwyddiant yr uchelgais hon. Felly, ambition. So, starting at the dechrau ar y dechrau, ac rwy'n siŵr beginning, and I'm sure that Hayden bod Hayden yn gallu dweud rhagor can say a little bit more about what am beth y mae'r gofrestr yn dweud the register tells us about the wrthym ni am y gweithlu addysg fel y education workforce as it is at the mae ar hyn o bryd. moment.

[175] **Mr Llewellyn:** Certainly. In terms of Welsh speakers, the number of Welsh speakers in the teaching workforce has been consistent for a number of years. We've reported it in our statistics at around about the 33 per cent mark. That is higher than the Welsh population, so it is an encouraging place to start.

[176] The key point we would indicate, and it's something we've been fairly clear on, is that under our expanded remit, we were asked to register support staff, teaching assistants and the like in Wales for the first time in April of this year. In doing that, we were told to expect, by the Welsh Government, to register 25,000 teaching support staff. That was the number we were told to expect. As at today, we've registered nearly 33,000—over 30,000 in schools and 2,500 in FE colleges—so it is clear that the percentage of the workforce now in our schools has got a far larger make-up of support staff and teaching assistants than ever before. The number has increased year on year, but it's to a scale that really I don't think anybody appreciated.

[177] We've seen similar in other professions, such as health and policing and the like, but this is the first time in teaching. The key challenge, therefore, for the Welsh language is—and we put this in our submission—that in trying to upskill the workforce, we can't just focus on schoolteachers—we absolutely have to focus on the support staff as well; otherwise, simply, this won't work.

[178] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rŷm ni'n mynd i symud at gwestiynau ynglŷn â Bethan Jenkins: We're going to move on now to questions on recruitment and Lee Waters is going to start the discussion. reciwtio ac mae Lee Waters yn mynd i gychwyn y drafodaeth.

[179] **Lee Waters:** On that point, what assessment is there on the language skill levels of the teaching support staff?

[180] **Mr Llewellyn:** Well, at the moment, very little. Having registered this significant cohort for the first time, as I mentioned, in April of this year, we will now, as a council, go about the same work we did for schoolteachers and that will populate the register so that, in Wales, we know for the first time what the language skills of those support staff are. So, we're starting from a low base, where there is no information about those people, but we will be able to populate that, certainly, with the support of support staff's trade unions, pretty quickly. So, in two, three or four years' time, we'll have, for the first time, a fairly good feel of what our baseline is for those support staff. Anecdotally, it's quite low—it's lower than schoolteachers.

[181] **Ms Jardine:** Also, we know about schoolteachers because we ask them two questions. One is, 'Are you able to speak Welsh?' and 'Are you able to teach through the medium of Welsh?' So, we've got figures on both of those, which are in our submissions as well. That's what I was referring to earlier in terms of the programmes that have been undertaken and funded in that the level of those hasn't changed since we started recording, really—they've been pretty consistent, even though there has been a significant investment in the amount of training that's been available for the Welsh language. So, that's something to look at—

[182] **Lee Waters:** Those figures are 33 per cent of teachers are Welsh speakers, but only 27 per cent can teach through the medium of Welsh.

[183] **Mr Llewellyn:** That is correct, yes.

[184] **Ms Jardine:** So, there's already a group of people there who could be targeted to enable them to feel more comfortable in teaching Welsh.

[185] **Lee Waters:** I was struck, when we held one of our first stakeholder sessions as part of this inquiry, when a headteacher of a Welsh-medium school said that when he speaks to colleagues in the English-medium sector, they talk about having a shortlist of candidates for a post. He considers that a luxury—he's lucky to get applicants, let alone enough to form a shortlist. So, are you concerned that there's a sufficient talent pool or skill pool out there for us to have the quality coming through in the teaching profession?

[186] **Mr Llewellyn:** In respect of recruitment and retention in teaching in Wales, we've always been in a better and different position to England. We see the headlines, and there was another one a couple of weeks ago, where a third of new teachers in England leave within five years. We've never had

those problems in Wales. Actually, over the last 10 years, we've cut our intake numbers because we were training too many teachers in Wales. Now, we're at about the right level. That said, for certain traditionally known shortage subjects in secondary—maths and the like, but also Welsh language and Welsh medium—it's always been more difficult to get the numbers. So, you're absolutely right. With that target of 2050 in mind, the first thing we need to do is to try and get that talent pool larger, because it's always been harder to get Welsh-speaking teachers.

10:45

[187] **Lee Waters:** But as things stand, is it sufficient to fuel an increase in capacity in the Welsh-medium sector? Schools are struggling to get a shortlist together.

[188] **Mr Llewellyn:** I would say we need more—that would be my view. Headteachers will tell you that when they advertise a Welsh-medium post, or it's in a Welsh language school, yes, definitely, the numbers to choose from are small, and if you look at the teacher training numbers each year, the intake that gained qualified teacher status in August, the number whose secondary subject was Welsh was 27. So, the bottom line is that it's small. We need more.

[189] **Lee Waters:** And that's got to be a concern in terms of standards, hasn't it?

[190] **Ms Jardine:** Well, I just think you need to have that body of people, because, obviously, the demand for Welsh-medium education is growing, and local authorities' provision is growing, and I think it's important there that we are taking account of it. There needs to be a strategic approach to this development. In previous years, we've had an overproduction generally of teachers, and there have been two reviews into initial teacher education recruitment numbers, where it was required for the numbers to be dropped. But we believe we're in a position now where that's actually bottomed out, and we need to start to look at the needs of the sector, and to start building those numbers up. And, of course, with widening the registration to other groups, we can look at increasing pathway opportunities where people may wish to move from being a learning support worker into becoming a teacher, or a schoolteacher becoming a further education lecturer as well. So, there are opportunities, not just to recruit new people, but to look at the workforce as a whole and to try and think of new ways to improve development

opportunities for individuals, as well as the sector.

[191] **Lee Waters:** And you said that the supply and demand is now better aligned, but I'm right to say that HEFCW and the Welsh Government don't make assessments about the number of Welsh-speaking teachers that are required. They just make an overall judgment. Is that right?

[192] **Ms Jardine:** Yes, I think—

[193] **Mr Llewellyn:** That is correct, yes. The other point I would like to add to what Angela has said there is that when the EWC was formed 18 months ago, following a renaming of the General Teaching Council for Wales, the National Assembly for Wales, in the Education (Wales) Act 2014 actually put an ability for us to promote careers in the registered professions. So, that would be schoolteachers, support staff, but also FE and youth work and work-based learning. To date, in our 18 months, we've not been asked by Government to take on any specific promotional or recruitment activities. And, certainly, with this further objective in this mind, in respect of Welsh speaking, that would seem to be an area where it may make sense for the Government to invite the professional body to do that work.

[194] **Lee Waters:** And you think that's doable, do you?

[195] **Mr Llewellyn:** Certainly the work is doable. We see how these sorts of campaigns operate in other countries and other professions, and I think we would reiterate that it is encouraging, that 2050 target. As I said in my first comments, a doubling in Welsh-speaking numbers is a stiff target, but at least we've got what looks like a realistic timetable. But we have to get those measures and strategies and implementation plans in place now really to stand a chance.

[196] **Lee Waters:** Okay. Thank you.

[197] **Mr Jardine:** I was going to add one more thing, if I may. Just to say that it's not just the school sector. We obviously look after the maintained schools sector, but we need to, in our opinion, look beyond that, because one of the success strategies would be engaging people at early years level. And we think there needs to be a strategy that looks across maintained and non-maintained sectors, because a lot of the early years provision obviously occurs in the non-maintained sector. So, that's key if you're looking at recruitment, to look across at everybody that's in the provider roles.

[198] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan Suzy **Bethan Jenkins:** Suzy has a question gwestiwn cyn i fi alw ar Dawn. before I call Dawn.

[199] **Suzy Davies:** It's just on the questions that you ask: 'Are you a Welsh speaker?' and 'Are you able to teach through the medium of Welsh?' I'm wondering if it would actually be more helpful if you changed the questions, because, certainly, anyone coming through your system as a new graduate now, if they come from Wales, will have had some exposure to the Welsh language as a compulsory part of their education. We've already heard from witnesses that people come in with different levels of Welsh into whatever the workforce is. Would it help you to identify what levels of Welsh skills they have, because self-identifying as a Welsh speaker, for some people who have Welsh language skills, they may put 'no' when, actually, they're halfway there?

[200] **Ms Jardine:** A lot of it's to do with confidence, and we recognise that. We almost have a two-tier system in terms of that confidence. There are those who feel confident in communicating, in reading and writing, and in public as well it's a different skill completely. So, I completely understand that. What we are doing currently on behalf of the Welsh Government, there's a national survey gone out, for the first time, to all registrants with us at the moment as well, which is asking specifically about their competence and their experience with the Welsh language. So, we think there will be some information that comes from that. We're hoping that will be reporting in January. Hayden?

[201] **Mr Llewellyn:** End of January, yes. There's an extended question there on registrants' Welsh language qualifications. So, working with the Welsh language unit in the Welsh Government, we've tried to expand that as much as we can to get as much information. But, certainly, we are open to your suggestion as well. We have an ability to add more questions to the register and, through the survey, collect information on a regular basis. I think we, as a council, would want to make that offer to you as a committee, and to the Welsh Government as well, that one of the strengths that we have as a body is that we are able to get to the front door or a tablet or the mobile phone of every single person who is registered with us, working in education—teachers, support staff, further education, and so on. So, if the Government is looking to get more information about the workforce, to undertake surveys, to get specific Welsh language knowledge, for example, we are well placed to do that.

[202] **Suzy Davies:** Well, that's good. I'm glad to hear that it's in hand. Thank you.

[203] **Bethan Jenkins:** A allaf i jest gofyn, cyn i Dawn ddod i mewn, a allech chi ddweud yn benodol faint o bobl sydd yn cymryd y cwrs sabothol? Roeddech chi'n dweud nad oedd y niferoedd yn uchel. Jest i gadarnhau ar gyfer y record.

Bethan Jenkins: Could I just ask, before Dawn comes in, if you could tell us specifically how many people actually take the sabbatical course? You mentioned that the numbers weren't high. Can you just put that on the record for us?

[204] **Mr Llewellyn:** Yes. It's not a programme that we manage, so I wouldn't be in a position to give specific numbers. I wouldn't have that to hand.

[205] **Ms Jardine:** Beth fedrwn ni ei ddweud yw nad ydym yn gweld bod pobl yn newid beth sydd ar y gofrestr o ran eu hyder i fedru dysgu drwy'r Gymraeg ar ôl gwneud y *sabbaticals*.

Ms Jardine: What we can say is that we don't see people changing what's on the register in terms of their confidence to be able to teach through the medium of Welsh after doing the sabbatical.

[206] **Bethan Jenkins:** A yw hynny achos nid ydych yn cysylltu â nhw yn weithredol, neu eu bod nhw jest yn teimlo nad yw e wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth? A ydych chi'n gwneud asesiad o pam nad yw hynny'n newid?

Bethan Jenkins: Is that because you don't contact them actively, or is it just because they feel it hasn't made a difference? Have you made an assessment of why that doesn't change?

[207] **Ms Jardine:** Nid ydym yn gallu dweud, ond mae yna gwestiwn i'w ofyn am hynny, onid oes, yn enwedig os bydd y cynllun hwnnw'n parhau. Efallai bod hynny'n rhywbeth i'w ystyried fel rhywun sydd yn adfyfrio ar y broses ei hun.

Ms Jardine: We can't tell you that, but there is a question to be asked there, isn't there, particularly if that scheme is to remain in place. That is something that should be considered as one reflects on the process itself.

[208] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sori, ond jest i gadarnhau, felly, nid eich rôl chi fyddai gofyn iddyn nhw i newid y

Bethan Jenkins: So, just to confirm, it wouldn't be your role to ask them to change the information that's part of

wybodaeth yn rhan o'r gofrestr.

the register.

[209] **Ms Jardine:** Na. Rydym yn gofyn iddyn nhw yn rheolaidd i wirio beth sydd ar ein cofrestr amdanyn nhw, a byddem yn gobeithio, wedyn, os oedd rhywun yn mynd i wneud y cyrsiau hyn, ac os oeddent yn teimlo eu bod yn fwy hyderus neu'n mynd i weithio yn y sector Gymraeg, y byddent yn mynd i wirio beth sydd gennym ni ar y gofrestr am hynny.

Ms Jardine: No. We ask them regularly to check and update the information on our register, but we would hope that if someone were to attend these courses, and if they felt that they were more confident in working in the Welsh sector, or wanted to go into the Welsh sector, that they would check the information on the register and update it accordingly.

[210] **Bethan Jenkins:** Océ. Diddorol. Diolch. Dawn.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay. Interesting. Thank you. Dawn.

[211] **Dawn Bowden:** Thank you. You've touched on it already, around the work around teaching assistants. I think the numbers you suggested are much higher than we previously thought. So, we're talking about pretty much half the workforce now in schools—our teaching assistants. We don't have the information. As you said, they've only just become part of the registrant workforce, so that's information that we'll get as we go along. But you've identified that you think the numbers that will identify as Welsh speakers or able to teach through the medium will be fewer than teachers. So, my question is in two parts then: what, do you think, is the particular contribution that teaching assistants, in the role that they undertake, can have in the Government's objective of achieving 1 million speakers; and what are the particular challenges around acquiring the necessary language skills for that particular group?

[212] **Mr Llewellyn:** I think, for me, if you look at where those teaching assistants are working, it's predominantly in early years and primary. So, if you think about trying to embed a language, that is your starting point. Certainly, in some of those settings—some of those primary schools—you'd be talking well over 50 per cent. It could be that 60 per cent, 70 per cent or even 80 per cent are support staff rather than teachers. So, it's really key that we get it right early; otherwise, people are not going to take the language on, and it is in those early years and primary settings. I think that's it, really. It's the fact that more and more of those teaching assistants are in those primary rather than secondary settings.

[213] **Dawn Bowden:** Yes. What do you see, if any, would be the particular barriers to increasing the language skills of that particular workforce?

[214] **Mr Llewellyn:** Well, in respect of in-service training, it needs to be a case of adequate funding and time to do the training, and also support for employers and by employers. Because, having recently registered this group, and working closely with their trade unions, we do sometimes hear about very little opportunity for support staff to have decent continuing professional development and professional learning. So, there it is, really. The workforce has changed: far more teaching assistants, mainly prevalent in early years and primary.

[215] **Ms Jardine:** In the work that we do alongside the trade unions there, we know that there is a thirst to learn amongst the sector as well, and that training that's been provided through the Wales Union Learning Fund, for example, has been really well subscribed—oversubscribed in many instances—with courses being run on Saturday mornings, and they've had really high take-up. So, I'd say that the sector is engaged in the desire for professional development.

[216] One thing that we suggested in our submission was to look at the online learning that's available, particularly for the language acquisitions that are necessary. If you look internationally, there's a lot there. We talk about accessing massive open online courses, and things like that, but when you look at the learning support staff, our colleagues in the trade unions alert us to the fact that there aren't as many there that have access to the digital tools and technology that might be commonplace for other sectors. So, in taking any development opportunities forward, you need to be cognisant of that as well.

[217] **Dawn Bowden:** So, there are slightly different challenges.

[218] **Ms Jardine:** Yes. So, I think you've got the engagement. You've got the important things there. Obviously, a lot of support staff are involved in the wider school provision as well—so, your breakfast clubs and your after-school clubs. I think if you want the language to thrive and to get away from this idea that it's something that you do in your classrooms at school, to normalise its use, then, you've got to look at the broad wraparound provision as well.

[219] **Dawn Bowden:** Yes, but unfortunately, we don't tend to have a process whereby teaching assistants, learning support assistants, are backfilled when they're off, unlike teachers where there's a supply teacher provision. There isn't if a teaching assistant goes off sick or goes away to train on something else. It's a gap that isn't plugged at the moment, isn't it?

[220] **Ms Jardine:** Yes.

[221] **Mr Llewellyn:** You are right, but what we found to be interesting in registering those support staff for the first time, historically on the register we've had over 5,000 teachers working on a supply basis, but we've also gleaned, for the first time now in Wales, that there are over 3,000 support staff working on a supply basis through agencies. So, that is getting close to the same number. But more so, they tend to cover for different reasons: less for the substantive staff to go out to do CPD; it's more for absence and things like that.

[222] **Dawn Bowden:** Sickness.

[223] **Mr Llewellyn:** Sickness, yes.

[224] **Dawn Bowden:** But if we're going to really encourage that group to take the time out to develop those skills, they need to have those positions backfilled while they're out, don't they, really?

[225] **Mr Llewellyn:** Of course. Yes.

[226] **Ms Jardine:** Estyn are very good at highlighting good practice. So, where those opportunities arise for every member of a school staff, they will have examples of that; and we'd encourage that to be widely looked at and shared through the sector.

[227] **Dawn Bowden:** Okay. Thank you very much.

[228] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy has a
Jeremy gwestiwn. question.

[229] **Jeremy Miles:** Jest i ddilyn y **Jeremy Miles:** Following on from the
cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r gweithlu question on the early years workforce
blynyddoedd cynnar yn benodol, ond specifically, but also more generally
hefyd yn fwy cyffredinol i'r gweithlu the workforce in general, do you have

yn gyffredinol, a oes gennych chi an assessment of the geographical
ddadansoddiad o'r dosbarthiad distribution of skills to speak Welsh?
daearyddol o'r sgiliau i siarad What impression do you have of the
Cymraeg? Beth yw'r argraff sydd pattern?
gennych chi o'r patrwm?

[230] **Mr Llewellyn:** Yes, we do hold that information. It's there on the register. It's as you'd expect in terms of Welsh language ability, speaking ability and teaching ability. It's more prevalent in the north, for example, but you are seeing a change. The demand for Welsh language teaching skills in Cardiff, for example, now has increased. You are seeing the population moving, following the work, in effect. So, we are seeing those changes.

11:00

[231] I think one of the other things that would be worth analysing is to look at the age profile of our teachers in terms of their Welsh language abilities. We need to make sure that it's not dying off at the end, and we've a good flow coming through. As we mentioned, in the next couple of years we'll have the same sort of data for the support staff as well, and those can be geographically analysed as well.

[232] **Jeremy Miles:** So, you make a specific point about the age profile there. Do you have a particular view on the distribution of language skills within the age profile that you have?

[233] **Mr Llewellyn:** I've not looked at it specifically, but I don't think there would be any immediate alarm bells that the language skills were concentrated in those about to retire. But it's certainly something we can look at in more detail along with the geographics.

[234] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydy e'n **Bethan Jenkins:** Would it be possible
bosibl i chi edrych ar hynny, ac for you to look at that and then
wedyn danfon llythyr neu ddarn o perhaps send us a letter or some
wybodaeth i ni ynglŷn â hynny? further information on that?

[235] **Ms Jardine:** Os oes yna unrhyw **Ms Jardine:** If there is anything that
beth a fydd o help i chi o'r gofrestr, could assist you on the register, then
gofynnwch, a gwnawn ni gyflawni just please request it, and we will
rhestr o beth rydych chi eisiau. provide you with that information.

[236] **Jeremy Miles:** Byddai hynny **Jeremy Miles:** That might be valuable. efallai yn werthfawr.

[237] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ie. Grêt, **Bethan Jenkins:** Great, thank you. diolch. Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen We'll move on to the upskilling of nawr at uwch-sgilio'r ymarferwyr practitioners, and Hannah has some yma. Mae gan Hannah gwestiynau i questions. chi.

[238] **Hannah Blythyn:** You mentioned earlier, I think, the need to look at new ways to enable the workforce to have development opportunities. I'd welcome your views on what you think the current capacity is within the sector to upskill both teachers and teaching assistants, who perhaps don't currently teach through the medium of Welsh. Also, what are your views on the barriers to that? Particularly, perhaps, for those who may not come from traditional Welsh-speaking areas, or who lack confidence in their own ability.

[239] **Mr Llewellyn:** There are barriers in terms of being in employment. I alluded to it already. It needs to be support from your employer, support given to your employer as well, so that teachers and support staff do have the time and the capacity to be able to do it. To try and upskill on top of existing teaching and support staff responsibilities just seems impractical, because obviously learning a new language, or further developing the language that you already have, is not an easy thing to do. So, the time and the support and the funding absolutely has to be there to do it. I wouldn't want to develop strategies on the hoof, but I think we need a range of strategies and implementation plans. There need to be things to get our young people learning Welsh and upskilling their Welsh at a young age, and that's something that is for the education profession but more widely as well. But then also those in-service programmes as well. I don't think, as Angela said earlier, they should just be concentrated on schools as well. We have FE practitioners registered with us, work-based learning practitioners who look after apprenticeships, and also shortly the youth service as well, and I think we should try and target some of that skills development across all our education settings, and not just schools.

[240] **Ms Jardine:** I think there's also a role that isn't filled currently as well, and it's something that we've lobbied for as a council, and it's that there needs to be a quality assurance of anything, any provision that is out there, because obviously there are significant amounts of money going into provision for training and that money needs to be spent in a good way where

it's going to have impactful results on the things that we want to see. So, we continue to lobby for having a role in the quality assurance of CPD, so that the providers that may suddenly pop up—because people wake up at different times, and they might be listening to these discussions and thinking, 'Well, there's a new market there', you know, and design a course or two.

[241] What we need to be assuring ourselves of nationally is that those are equally available, regardless of where you live, and that you have access to them even if you're not in continuous employment, so that those on the supply list, for example, have access to them, because they play a key role. Also, that the quality is there, so, the accessibility is the same and the quality is the same, so there is a role there for a national body. I've taken my lobbying hat off there as well, but I thought I'd make that point.

[242] The other thing I'd say is that, whilst there is a will to engage with professional development, you know as well as we do how busy it is in schools at the moment, and we're undergoing a period probably of the most significant change that we've had since 1988. It would be remiss of us not to say that this could be really positive. But if we keep coming at it from an angle where all of these things are treated separately, it can become overwhelming and unwieldy. I think the opportunity here is to just pause and look at all of the activity that's going on, and to weave this desire to increase Welsh language speakers through everything that's going on and not see it as an adjunct or a bolt-on. I think now is the time to do that, as the progress is starting to occur.

[243] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes unrhyw gwestiynau eraill ar uwchsgilio? **Bethan Jenkins:** Are there any other questions on upskilling? Everything Popeth yn iawn? Symudwn ymlaen, okay? We'll move on, therefore, to felly, at ddilyniant, ac mae gan progression, and Jeremy has a Jeremy gwestiwn. question.

[244] **Jeremy Miles:** Ar y syniad yma o ddilyniant rhwng y camau addysgiadol o'r blynyddoedd cynnar i addysg statudol, ac wedyn i'r sector pellach ac uwch, a dweud y gwir—continwmm y siwrnai ysgol, y siwrnai addysgiadol—beth yw eich argraff chi o faint o gydweithio sy'n digwydd ar **Jeremy Miles:** On this issue of the continuum from the early years, through statutory education and to the FE and HE sectors—that's the educational journey—what's your impression of the collaboration happening along that journey between the organisations

hyd y siwrnai hynny, rhwng y cyrff responsible at all stages? Do you sy'n gyfrifol am bob cam? A oes think that collaboration is gennych chi argraff bod hynny'n happening? digwydd?

[245] **Ms Jardine:** Rydym ni'n **Ms Jardine:** We think that perhaps it's meddwl efallai ei fod yn dechrau starting to happen more and more. digwydd yn fwy ac yn fwy. Oddi ar fis Since April, of course, we've started Ebrill, wrth gwrs, rydym wedi dechrau to register new groups. By next April, cofrestru grwpiau newydd. Erbyn mis we will be registering those who are Ebrill nesaf, byddwn yn cofrestru'r in the teaching groups in the rhai sydd yn y grwpiau dysgu yn y workplace, and youth groups and gweithlu hefyd, a grwpiau ieuenctid— those who look after those groups. y rhai sydd yn gofalu drostyn nhw So, there is a way for us, as a body, hefyd. Felly, mae yna fodd i ni, fel to start collaborating between the corff, ddechrau cydweithio rhwng y sectors, because we see that perhaps sectorau achos ein bod yn gweld that hasn't been happening as well as efallai bod hynny heb ddigwydd mor it should have in the past, and there dda yn y gorffennol, a bod yna fodd is a means of improving what is gwella beth sy'n dechrau digwydd ar starting to happen at the moment. hyn o bryd.

[246] I don't know whether you want to say any more.

[247] **Mr Llewellyn:** Yes—

[248] **Jeremy Miles:** A gaf i jyst ofyn, **Jeremy Miles:** Could I just pick up on i bigo un pwynt o'r ateb, beth one point there? What do you see as fydddech chi'n ei ddweud yw'r the barriers in the past? What are the rhwystrau sydd wedi bod yn y reasons why it hasn't happened gorffennol? Beth yw'r rhesymau pam sufficiently in the past? nad yw e wedi digwydd yn ddigonol?

[249] **Ms Jardine:** Jest y ffaith ein **Ms Jardine:** Just the fact that we've bod ni wedi bod yn gweithio fel been working as sectors on a sectorau ar wahân. separate basis.

[250] **Jeremy Miles:** Reit. Jest arfer. **Jeremy Miles:** So just practice.

[251] **Ms Jardine:** Ie, am wn i. **Ms Jardine:** Yes, I suppose.

[252] **Jeremy Miles:** Okay. Sorry.

[253] **Mr Llewellyn:** I think Government deserves credit for formally recognising that there are a number of sectors responsible and involved in education and training. So, the decision to re-badge the GTCW to become the EWC and make a decision—it is Wales leading the way, actually, that we are registering support staff, FE, work-based learning and youth work over and above teachers. You won't see that elsewhere in the world. So, it is a bold decision. But as Angela said, having made the decision, it's important that all the sectors are talking together, and that the Government officials responsible for those areas are working together. We're seeing it as early days at the minute, and we sometimes have to undertake a brokering role to bring the officials together, to work together and see the benefits of sharing and working together. So, I think it's important to be realistic and say that Wales is leading the way here. It's early days, but we do need to do more in bringing the sectors together, sharing best practice, learning and looking at the economies of scale as well.

[254] **Jeremy Miles:** Okay. And looking at the question of integration from another direction, what's your view on the extent to which, across the Welsh-medium education sector generally, there is integration and collaboration between Welsh Government strategy and local authority strategies and the funding that goes with them? What's your sense of how well that picture knits together, if you like?

[255] **Mr Llewellyn:** Definitely room for improvement, but I think this strategy could be the, or one of the, stimuli for that. As Angela said, it's important that we treat this strategy not as another one over and above all the other initiatives, certainly in education, but that we try and make this cut across all the other initiatives and challenges that we have. So, it could be that this is the opportunity to help do it. But there's certainly room for improvement.

[256] **Jeremy Miles:** Can I just ask on that—? What does it look like? What does the process look like, from your perspective, in terms of workforce issues, in particular weaving this strategy into the Donaldson work and the other initiatives? What other sort of practical steps would you expect to see happening in order for that to become a reality? It's a great aspiration, obviously, but turning it into reality is perhaps a different matter.

[257] **Mr Llewellyn:** What I would suggest first is that we just re-group in

Wales and look at the other initiatives that we have in place, because the Welsh Government is trying to be bold in terms of education and acknowledges that it needs to be bold and to improve because of things like PISA and the OECD and so on. But we have to improve. So, the Government is trying to be bold in that regard, to move forward, but there are quite a number of initiatives running at the moment: the Donaldson curriculum and assessment review; the reform of initial teacher training; the early years 10-year strategy—and I could go on. So, I think it's worth having a look, re-grouping and seeing where this Welsh language proposal fits into that, because the bottom line is that, if you want to succeed to the 1 million target, it is, in the main, education professionals and practitioners that are going to be the lead in terms of delivering that. So, if you don't do that, step back, have a look and see where this can be integrated into the existing initiatives and strategies, and also the new ones, then it probably isn't going to work.

11:10

[258] **Ms Jardine:** And it might be as simple as appointing somebody to do that, looking across the sectors and looking at the initiatives that are being proposed at the moment, to make sure that the element of the Welsh language development is in it.

[259] **Jeremy Miles:** Okay. Diolch yn fawr.

[260] **Bethan Jenkins:** Neil, **Bethan Jenkins:** Neil has some cwestiynau ynglŷn â chategoreiddio questions on categorisation and the a'r continwwm ieithyddol. continuum.

[261] **Neil Hamilton:** Where do you think we've got to now in culture and attitudes towards Welsh-medium education in local authorities and in the education sector generally, and to what extent do you think there's a variability in enthusiasm for this and a willingness to make it happen?

[262] **Ms Jardine:** In our role, I don't know whether or not it's appropriate to comment, really. All that we can say is that there is a growing and noticeable call on local authorities to provide Welsh-medium education, that teachers who are working in the sector are saying that their Welsh language skills are needing development as well, because they notice that incidental Welsh is no longer enough, and we're looking to increase the levels that we're using, and the needs need to be met. There have been structural changes to the way

school improvement has been introduced in Wales through the consortia, and one of the key points of that is looking at the role of the *athrawon bro*, who supported schools individually and now are being based more in a hub-school model, to work out. That needs to be looked at, to see whether or not that's going to continue in its most powerful form as well, or whether it gets diluted as it goes into schools. Where budgets are tight, sometimes the focus on things that aren't ring-fenced sort of shifts into keeping staffing as it can be. Some experience from other areas shows that, where that has occurred—and you can look at England for this as well, for example, at the ethnic minority achievement grants; once they were given to schools, the provision that was ring-fenced and provided at a local authority level diminished once it went to schools and became part of the whole, total school budget and wasn't ring-fenced. So, there's a danger that could occur. I'm not saying that it is, but that's something to be mindful of as we go forward. All we can do is provide figures on that geography, again, and to see whether take-up is greater or lesser, and where the demand is. It's for others to comment on whether they feel that demand is being met and being welcomed. But I think, certainly, everybody's signed up officially to what they need to be doing, and there's a Welsh Language Commissioner to make sure that they are now as well.

[263] **Mr Llewellyn:** I would add that, in terms of the new Welsh language standards that have been rolled out by the commissioner, they apply to our organisation from the April coming, and I think it's fair to say the bodies to which they'll apply are trying to go at them with enthusiasm and endeavour, and it's making us think about the quality of our service through the language of Welsh. We are finding the Welsh Language Commissioner and her team very, very supportive in making sure that we deliver on expectations under the standards.

[264] **Neil Hamilton:** Good; well, that's very interesting. The other question I have is in relation to moving education through the continuum, from English-only schools to bilingual schools, from bilingual schools to Welsh-medium schools, and so on—what are the challenges and the potential here in terms of school categorisation and whether you can give us any opinions on that, where we are and the practical challenge in making the transition, because, clearly, it's a massive decision to take. The timing of it is difficult.

11:15

[265] **Ms Jardine:** It's all down to capacity and numbers again, really, isn't it?

So, the numbers, at the moment, aren't there, but what we see is that there is a willingness there from the vast majority of the profession to engage with Welsh language development and their role in that as well. So, I think it comes back to having realistic timescales and to providing development opportunities and engaging people, rather than compelling people to join in.

[266] **Mr Llewellyn:** I would re-emphasise that point about promotion and recruitment, though, as I say, because, at the end of the day, some people who can speak Welsh or have the aptitude to do so do leave and go to England or elsewhere for job opportunities. If we can make teacher training, FE and support staff roles attractive, so that we do attract our Welsh speakers and retain them in Wales—. So, promotion of careers, making sure our careers are attractive and marketing them appropriately, I think, are really important as part of this strategy to meet the number.

[267] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan Dai Lloyd has a question on that specifically.

[268] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr. Jest following on from your comments and the need for enthusiasm, we always need enthusiasm in everything that we do. But naturally, and specifically on the need in some areas to change attitudes and to change the mindset towards the Welsh language, that can be challenging, as one who has been campaigning to open Welsh-medium schools in the Swansea area for some 30 years and continues to have to fight those battles, in the face of elements that can be quite opposed to the language. Following on from what Neil asked you about enthusiasm and attitudes, do you see that you as a council have a role in engendering that enthusiasm towards the Welsh language? In this new context, we expect to have a million Welsh speakers by halfway

disgwyl nawr fod yna filiwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn mynd i fod erbyn hanner ffordd trwy'r ganrif yma, achos dyna ydy ewyllys sefydlog y Llywodraeth. Wedyn, man a man i bobl fynd efo'r lli, yntefe? A ydych chi'n gweld bod gennych chi rôl fel cyngor, felly, i ennyn y brwdfrydedd yna rydych chi'n sôn amdano fe? Wedi'r cwbl, ychydig dros ganrif yn ôl, roedd gennym ni filiwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg, a dim ond un ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg a oedd gennym ni bryd hynny, a honno ym Mhatagonia, felly nid oedd hi'n llawer o help. Rwy'n deall bod pethau wedi newid ers hynny, ond weithiau mae yna agweddau anffodus gwrth-Cymraeg yn dal i fod. Nid wyf i'n gwybod os ydych chi'n teimlo bod gennych chi rôl fel cyngor, felly, i ennyn brwdfrydedd lle bo ei angen.

through this century, because that is the established will of Government. So, shouldn't people go with the flow, as it were, in that regard? Do you think that you as a council, therefore, have a role in engendering that enthusiasm that you talk about? After all, a little over a century ago, we had a million Welsh speakers, and we only had one Welsh-medium school at the time, and that was in Patagonia, so that wasn't a great deal of assistance. I do understand that things have changed since then, but, sometimes, there are some unfortunate attitudes and some anti-Welsh attitudes that persist. I wondered if you as a council felt that you had a role in engendering enthusiasm where that's needed.

[269] **Mr Llewellyn:** Our responsibility is for those in the workforce; it's about the workforce. So, we'd say, in the main, our role is to attract people with the skills, the aptitude or the interest into the profession. So, while we do have a public role in respect of safeguarding and the like, in this regard, our role, I think, primarily is—we would see and we would invite the Government to take up the clause in the Act to invite us to do work specifically on promotion and recruitment to get people in. Because, as I've said a few times, the key to this is that you've got the education professionals who can develop the young people to upskill them. This is the only way to do this.

[270] **Ms Jardine:** Rydw i'n meddwl hefyd fod angen sylweddoli nad ydym ni'n gwybod yr atebion i gyd eto, ond mae yna gyfle inni fel corff hefyd i gyfrannu at hynny wrth ofyn y cwestiynau ar ran y Llywodraeth a chydweithio efo'r sectorau.

Ms Jardine: I think, also, there is a need to realise that we don't know all the answers yet, but there is an opportunity for us as a body to contribute to that by asking the questions on behalf of the Government and collaborating with

the sectors.

[271] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes unrhyw gwestiynau eraill cyn inni gloi? Na. Felly, diolch yn fawr iawn ichi am ddod yma heddiw ac mae'n siŵr y byddwch chi'n cymryd diddordeb yn yr ymchwiliad. Hefyd, efallai y byddwn ni'n cysylltu â chi i ofyn am fwy o wybodaeth yng nghyd-destun y gofrestr, achos rwy'n credu efallai y byddai pwynt mewn gofyn ichi ynglŷn â phrentisiaethau ac yn y blaen hefyd, ynglŷn â'r gyfran o bobl sydd yn gwneud prentisiaethau trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, efallai bod hynny'n rhywbeth inni ysgrifennu atoch chi ynglŷn ag e hefyd yn y dyfodol, ond diolch yn fawr iawn ichi heddiw.

Bethan Jenkins: Are there any other questions before we close? No. Thank you very much for coming here today, and I'm sure you will take an interest in the inquiry. Also, we will perhaps be in touch to ask for more information in the context of the register, because I think there would be a point in asking about apprenticeships, and the proportion of people who are following apprenticeships through the medium of Welsh. So, perhaps that is something that we will write to you about as well in the future, but thank you very much for today.

11:19

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod ar gyfer Eitem 7**

**Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting for Item 7**

Cynnig:

Motion:

bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu that the committee resolves to gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y exclude the public from the cyfarfod yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog remainder of the meeting in 17.42(vi).

accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi).

Cynigiwyd y cynnig.

Motion moved.

[272] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwy'n cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i benderfynu

Bethan Jenkins: I propose under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to

gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod ar exclude the public for item 7. Is
gyfer eitem 7. A yw pawb yn hapus i everybody content?
hynny ddigwydd? Diolch yn fawr.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 11:20.

The public part of the meeting ended at 11:20.